

# Jehona SPAHIU JANCHEVSKA

# THE LAST JUDGEMENT IN THE CHURCH OF ST. GEORGE IN BANJANI

Key words: Banjani, narthex, Last Judgement, Dicho Zograf, hermeneia

Abstract: The church of St. George built and painted in 1548/49, is located in the village of Banjani near Skopje. The appearance of the single-aisle church was altered during the 19th century when the narthex was added. The inscription above the western entrance leading to the nave indicates that the renovation of the church was a merit of the donor Petar Kaovche and the local villagers. In addition it is stated that the paintings are work of the painter Dimitar Krstev(ich) - Dicho from Debar, completed in1846. On the entire surface of the eastern wall of the narthex, Dicho Zograf depicted the impressive and complex composition of the Last Judgement, characterized by rich illustrative qualities, a narrative approach, and an extraordinary sense of detail, accompanied by numerous explanatory inscriptions. In this composition he incorporated many new themes with a moralizing-didactic character, motifs with Russian and Bulgarian provenance, and apocalyptic components.

The small church dedicated to the victorious saint and the great martyr George, built and painted in 1548/49, is located in the village of Banjani near Skopje.<sup>1</sup> The appearance of the single-aisle church was altered during the 19<sup>th</sup> century when new windows were opened and the narthex was added. The iconostasis was completed in 1845 according to the inscription on one of the royal icons (The Virgin Ho-

degetria) signed by the famous painter Dimitar Krstev(ich) - Dicho from Tresonche,<sup>2</sup> near Debar, who at that time had painted prolifically in the Skopje region, especially in Banjani.<sup>3</sup>

The inscription above the western entrance leading to the nave indicates that the renovation of the church was a merit of the donor Petar Kaovche and the local

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Балабанов К., Николовски А., Ќорнаков Д., Споменици на културата во СР Македонија, Скопје 1971, 40; Суботић Г., Свети Ђорђе у Бањанима, ЗЛУ 21 (1985), 136-146; Idem, "Свети Ђорђе у Бањанима. Зидно сликарство", in: Група автори, На траговима Војислава Ј. Ђурића, САНУ / МАНУ, Београд 2011, 325-355; Popovska-Korobar, V., Church of St. George – Village of Banjani, nr. Skopje, in: Macedonian Cultural Heritage. Christian Monuments, Skopje 2008, 52-55.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> From the numerous papers and articles on the work of Dicho Zograf, on this occasion we distinguish several of them: Василиев А., Дичо Зограф, Македонска мисъл, кн. 7-8, год. 1 (1946), 372-384; Idem, Български възрожденски майстори: живописци, резбари, строители, София 1965, 180-187; Грозданов Ц., Почетоците на Дичо Зограф и иконостасот во село Росоки, Прилози. Одделение за општествени науки, МАНУ, XXV 1-2 (1994) (=Idem, Уметноста и културата на XIX век во Западна Македонија: Студии и прилози, Скопје 2004, 63-77); Idem, За влијанието на Христофор Жефарович врз делата на Дичо Зограф и Аврам Дичов, Годишен зборник, кн. 23 (49), Филозофски факултет, Универзитет Св. Кирил и Методиј (1996) (=Idem, Уметноста и културата на XIX век во Западна Македонија: Студии и прилози, Скопје 2004, 95-120); Idem, Дичо Зограф и неговите ученици во црквата Св. Илија во Стенче, Гостиварско, Културно наследство XXVI-XXVII/2000-2001 (2001), 7-26; Idem, Белешки за Дичо Зограф по повод сто и триесет години од неговата смрт, Прилози. Одделение за општествени науки, МАНУ, XXXIII 1 (2002), 5-22; Алексиев Е., Дичо Зограф. Иконопис, Скопје 1997; Икони од охридскиот опус на Дичо Зограф (автор на изложбата и текстот: Георгиевски М.), Охрид 1999; Цветковски С., Живописот на Дичо Зограф и Аврам Дичов: Студии и прилози, Струга 2010, 13-176; Idem, Иконите на Дичо Зограф од ирквите во Дебар и Мала Река, Струга 2013.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Алексиев Е., *Op.cit.*, 8-10; *Иконописното творештво на Дичо Зограф во Скопје и Скопскиот регион* (автор на изложбата и текстот: Грозданова Коцевски В.), Музеј на град Скопје, Скопје 2008, 3-4; Popovska-Korobar V., *Church of St. George*, 55.



Ill. 1. The Last Judgement on the east wall of the narthex, church of St. George in Banjani (1846)

villagers. In addition it is stated that the paintings are the work of the painter Dimitar Krstev(ich) - Dicho from Debar, completed on December 5, 1846<sup>4</sup>:

ВО СЛАВХ БЛІЮ Н ВО НМА СТАГС СЛАВНАГС ВЕЛИКОМУЧЕНИКА [ГЕСЛГІ́Н] ЧУДОТВОРЦА, СЛАВНАГС СТЫН [Х]РАМЪ, СЕН ВО ЛЕТО, С ХР́СТА ... ВЪ ТОНЖЕ ВГЕМА СЪГРЪТАШЕСА СМИРЕНЬИ КТИТОРЪ ПЕТРЪ КАСЕЧЕ ЗАЧА, Н СОВЕРШИ СОВСЪМИ ПРАВОСЛАВНИН ИЖЕ ССЕРЪТИВШИМСА ВО СЕЛО СЕН ВЕЛІКІ́Н МЪЖЕ И МАЛИ, АЕФИМЕРИА СЕ НАХОДЕШЕ ПАПА УРОШ, А СМИРЕНЫИ, ЗСГРАФЪ ДИМИТРИА С КАЗА ДЕБОРЪ, КРЪСТЕВІ́ЧЪ, СОХРАНИ ЃСДИ ВЕСЪ СЕИ И ВСА ПРАВОСЛ[А]ВИЛА ХР́СТИАЛИ АМИНЪ. МСЦА ДЕКЕМВРІ́[Н]5 : АССИЯ.<sup>5</sup>

On the entire surface of the eastern wall of the narthex, Dicho Zograf depicted the impressive and complex composition of the Last Judgement, characterized by rich illustrative qualities, a narrative approach, and an extraordinary sense of detail, accompanied by numerous explanatory inscriptions (ill. 1).<sup>6</sup> At the same time, it is important to note that the Last

Judgement in Banjani is the only known example of this composition in his work.

According to recent research, it is considered that some of the earliest works of Dicho Zograf are four royal icons painted in 1844 from the church of St.Nedelya, in the village of Debrene, in the vicinity of the town Sandanski in Bulgaria.<sup>7</sup> Probably created after his visit of the Rila Monastery, they would be his earliest works on Bulgarian territory.<sup>8</sup> Besides being such a productive artist, Dicho Zograf is also known as an editor of two painter's manuals, the First Hermeneia (prior to 1844) and the Second Hermeneia (1851), compiled from various sources and paper icons,9 which among other themes contain descriptions of the Last Judgement. It is also well known that Dicho Zograf for the most part has formed his painterly style thanks to the tuition received in the workshop of the painter Mihail from Samarina, and his son Dimitar/Daniil.10 This is especially notewor-

10 Грозданов Ц., Почетоците на Дичо Зограф, 63-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> For the revision of the year of completion of the paintings in the Banjani narthex, see Грозданова Коцевски В., *Op.cit.*, 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> In the transcription of the inscriptions and texts, the symbols [] are used for lost/damaged letters, while other words are transmitted as they are written without reading the ligatures.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> We presented the church of St. George, including the Last Judgement, and also the Monastery of St. Elijah in Banjani in the article: *Александар Велики може да се види на Скопска Црна Гора* by Stojanovska B., published in the daily newspaper "Nova Makedonija", No. 23.7010, Year LXXI, Tuesday, March 15<sup>th</sup> 2016, 14-15, followed by a short promotional video #RaskaziNiZaMakedonija on YouTube: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pwX2YXud5Ig&feature=youtu.be (accessed February 24, 2018).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Гергова И., *Най-ранните икони на Дичо Зограф в България*, Патримониум.МК 14, Скопје 2016, 203-212. <sup>8</sup> *Ibidem*, 208-209.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Мутафов Е., Поглед врз двете ерминии на Дичо Зограф, Зборник за средновековна уметност на Музејот на Македонија 3 (2001), 268-280; Иванова Т., Страшния съд според Ерминиите на Българските възрожденски зографи, Богословска мисъл. Докторантски изследвания, кн. 1-2, 2012, 50-86 (in the further references the pagination of the text is quoted according to the article available on the author's profile on Academia. edu: https://uni-sofia.academia.edu/TatyanaIvanova). A. Kuymdzhiev notes many coincidences and similarities between the paintings of the main Rila church and the descriptions in Dicho Zograf's Hermeneia, see Куюмджиев А., Стенописите в Главната църква на Рилския манастир, София 2015, 567.



Ill. 2. The Prepared Throne, the symbols of Evangelists, Adam and Eve, the two groups of poor people separated as grateful righteous and beggars-sinners, Archangel (Gabriel) with groups of righteous, church of St. George in Banjani (1846)

thy in the similarities of the Last Judgement in Banjani with the same composition from the church of St. George in Lazaropole (1836), the work of Mihail from Samarina.<sup>11</sup> However, in addition to the obvious similarities and influences from him, Dicho Zograf in Banjani created a composition in which he incorporated many new themes with a moralizing-didactic character, motifs with Russian and Bulgarian provenance, and apocalyptic components. It is from this work that his disciples and followers would draw inspiration, especially his sons Avram and Spiridon (Spire), although Dicho's variant would not be repeated.

On the entire wall surface is the composition of the Last Judgement, while the depictions of the Deësis and the Apostles today are not visible due to the flat wooden ceiling added later.<sup>12</sup> Under the ceiling are the depictions of the Prepared Throne, Adam and Eve, the group of poor people, the righteous, Heaven, the Four Rivers, the Weighing of Souls (Psychostasia), the General resurrection, Hell/the Fiery River and the Aerial Tollbooths, Moses and the group of Jews, and the Four Kingdoms. Within the Last Judgement additional themes are incorporated such as three scenes related to the prophet Elijah, the righteous Enoch and the Antichrist, the Wheel of Life and the Sacred Confession. On both sides of the entrance to the nave there are five so-called pseudo-icons of Jesus Christ Pantocrator, the Holy Mother of God with Christ, St. John the Forerunner, the patron St. George slaying the Dragon, and St.Demetrios conquering the beast.

### The Magnificent Prepared Throne

On the highest visible surface is the lavishly decorated *Prepared Throne* depicted above clouds, where a pillow is set, on which the Christ's blue cloak is placed. Above them are the Gospel and the Dove (the Holy Ghost), while on the background a part of the Holy Cross which probably had large dimensions can be seen. On the four sides of the Throne were the symbols of the Evangelists from which only the lion-Mark (MPK) is visible on the left side and the calf – Luke ( $\overline{\Lambda}$ K) on the right side. Besides the Throne are Adam ( $\overline{A}AMM$ ) and Eve ( $\overline{C}BA$ ) with nimbuses, kneeling in a proskynetic attitude with crossed arms on their chest. Behind them, according to the remains, the archangels Gabriel and Michael were presented, also with their hands crossed (ill. 2).

The Prepared Throne is mentioned many times in the Psalms 9:7-8 and 89, 14, and in Psalm 103:19 as a "throne in heaven", while according to the Revelation of St. John 4:2 "the throne was set in heaven". The throne is an indispensable part of this composition since the earliest examples, with some differences and variations in its form and components. Although the instruments of crucifixion are not visible in our example, together with the cross they determine the soteriological message of this motif with-

<sup>77;</sup> Тричковска Ј, Делата во Македонија на сликарското семејство на Михаил од Самарина, Докторска дисертација, Филозофски факултет – Скопје, Скопје 2008, 65-66.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Тричковска Ј., *Страшниот суд во цр. Св. Ѓорѓи* во Лазарополе, Патримониум.МК 14 (2016), 213-238.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> In the documentation of the NI Conservation Centre - Skopje, as well as in the literature, there is no data about the exact time of the repairs, i.e. when the addition of the wooden ceiling was undertaken.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Brenk B., Die Anfänge der byzantinischen Weltger-

in the Last Judgement.<sup>13</sup> Adam and Eve, usually represented with nimbuses, are almost always present in the proximity of the Throne, which emphasize the symbolism of the redeemed sin thanks to Christ's sacrifice.

# The Grateful righteous

Behind Adam and Eve are two groups of poor people consisted of beggars, lame and blind (ill. 2). The group of poor people (IIH[T]AYH) behind Adam is led by an old man leaning on a crutch on whose saddle part his cut leg is set, and with his left raised hand holds a scroll containing the gratitude of the righteous: **ΔΓΟΔΑΡΪΜ**§ Ö ΠΓΑΕ€ΔΝΙΗ. On his shoulder there is a large bag, and the other figures also carry full bags, canes and (shepherd's) crooks, while some of them have characteristic caps in the form of klobuks on their heads. The poor people are shown in modest folk costumes consisted of dark shirts, white underwear with long trousers, socks and peasant shoes (opinci). The last participant of the group, presented as a blind man, holds a string instrument that looks like a kemene or a gusle.<sup>14</sup> The group of three poor people behind Eve today is not visible in the upper part due to the added pillar. One of them is leaning on a crutch where his leg is set. All three are barefoot, with short trousers or shirts, while in their hands they hold crooks and empty bags with openings turned downwards.

The representations of the poor people who are treated as a post-Byzantine inno-

ichtsdarstellung, Byzantinische Zeitschrift 57/1, München 1964, 119-121. For the dominance of the Holy Cross in the Middle and Late Middle Ages, as well as for the other components, see: Серафимова А., Семиотичка анализа и поствизантиски паралели на Страшниот суд во кучевишките Свети Архангели, Културно наследство 28-29/2002-03 (2004), 170-171.

<sup>14</sup> Цимревски Б., Претставите на музичките инструменти на фреските и дрворезите во Македонија, Македонски фолклор, Година IX, бр. 17 (1976), 160-161. It is known that gusle singers were blind persons or with physical disability, cf. Stevenson B. L., The Gusle Singer and His Songs, American Anthropologist, New Series, Vol. 17, No. 1 (Jan. - Mar., 1915), 58, 60.

<sup>15</sup> For the motif of the poor people, the oldest known illustration, the inscriptions, as well as numerous examples



Ill. 3 a). The Holy Mother of God flanked by the Archangels; the forefathers Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob, children as virgins and the Righteous Thief in Heaven; b) The Four Rivers; c) The inscription on the Gate of Heaven, church of St. George in Banjani (1846)

and variants, see: Simić-Lazar D., Le Jugement dèrnier de l'église des Saints Pierre et – Paul de Tutin en Yougoslavie, Cahiers balkaniques 6 (1864), 239-241; Eadem, Иконографија Страшног суда у цркви св. Петра и Павла у Тутину, Саопштења XVII (1985), 171-172; Eadem, La signification de la représentation des pauvres dans les Jugements derniers post-byzantins, ZLU 23, (1987), 175-182; Пенкова Б., "Тия мои наималки братя" в по-



Ill. 4. St. Peter as a leader of the righteous who will enter Heaven, church of St. George in Banjani (1846)

vation in the iconography of the Last Judgement,<sup>15</sup> will remain its constant even during the 19<sup>th</sup> century. The textual model for their visualization is in the Gospel of Matthew 25:34-41, and the quotations from his gospel that often convey the motif of the poor,<sup>16</sup> in this case are not visible or were left out. In this example, a clear distinction is made between the two groups, separated as grateful righteous who receive protection from Christ, and beggars-sinners who will be condemned for their ruthlessness and greed. Although the group on the right-hand side of the composition is not fully visible, the determining elements for their classification are the inscriptions, as well as their full or empty bags.<sup>17</sup> We note a similar depiction of the distinction of the poor people as righteous and sinners, including the text on the scroll, in the church of St. George in Lazaropole.<sup>18</sup>

Behind the group of the poor on the left side is the Archangel (Gabriel) in royal dalmatica who, with one hand, points at the Judge, and with the other hand holds a scroll on which the words according to the Gospel of John 5:29, and taken from Daniel 12:2 are written: COTE[0]FIIIIH EAFAA, EL BOCKFIIIGNIG AHEOTA ("And shall come forth; they that have done good, unto the resurrection of life..."). The Archangel is the leader of the group of the righteous led by monks with the explanatory inscription: IIFAEGANIH AHEATL

ствизантиската иконография на Страшния съд и в контекста на Балканската народна култура, Проблеми на изкуството 4 (1993), 21-27; Eadem, "Стенописи върху фасадата", во: Геров Г., Пенкова Б., Божинов Р., Стенописите на Роженския манастир, София 1993, 68-69; Грозданов Ц., Страшниот суд во црквата Свети Климент (Богородица Перивлептос) во Охрид во светлината на тематските иновации на XVI век, Културно наследство 22-23/1995-96 (1997), 52-55; Серафимова А., Семиотичка анализа и поствизантиски паралели, 172-174; Eadem, Кучевишкиот манастир Свети Архангели, Скопје 2005, 181; Поповска-Коробар В., Сликарството на западната фасада на манастирската црква во Слимница, Monumenta 1 (2016), 152-153, п. 42; Тричковска Ј., Страшниот суд во цр. Св. Ѓорѓи, 221-223.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> The various variants of the accompanying texts in our examples, including the most complete among them, are presented by: Грозданов Ц., *Страшниот суд во ирквата Свети Климент*, 53-54.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> The determining element for the distinction of the two groups of the poor through full and empty bags is announced by Dicho Zograf himself in his Second Hermeneia, Василиев А., *Ерминии. Технология и иконография*, София 1976, 120.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Тричковска Ј., *Страшниот суд во цр. Св. Ѓорѓи*, 223, ill. 3-4.



Ill. 5. TheWeighing of Souls (Psychostasia), church of St. George in Banjani (1846)

**EO BTKH** (Matthew 25:46). Behind the monks there is a group of figures of different ages with rich outfits consisted of long shirts and fur lined coats, and turbans or hats on their heads, some of them also decorated with fur (ill. 2).

The Archangels as God's messengers of the judgement that is to be brought into the deeds of man, are also related to the inclusion of individual groups of the poor and the righteous, but also the sinners. Besides the figures of monks, the righteous, who according to the rich clothes were obviously members of a higher social rank, are included.<sup>19</sup> The inclusion of the quotation according to the Gospel of John on the archangel's scroll is previously recorded in the Last Judgement from Lazaropole.<sup>20</sup>

# The Garden of Eden

On the northern part of the wall surface, Heaven (PAH) is depicted as a delightful garden with flowers and cypresses surrounded by a wall and towers,

where the common representations are aranged in two zones. In the upper part on a honorary place, the Holy Mother of God (MHP  $\Theta$ Y) is seated on a lavishly decorated throne flanked by the two archangels, standing on a suppedaneum. The Mother of God in her right hand holds a flower/blossoming branch, while her left palm is opened forwards. In the second zone, under her representation, the three forefathers Abraham, Isaac and Jacob are depicted.<sup>21</sup> Right next to them are three figures with smaller dimensions than the others, apparently of children, signified as virgins (ABL), and further on is the figure of the Righteous Thief with the cross on his shoulders (PAZEOHNH) (ill. 3a). At the foot of Heavens wall from arched openings four rivers Phison, Gihon, Euphrates and Tigris flow (PEKA &CONL, FEONL, E&PATL, THFFL) (ill. 3b).

On the arched part of the Gate of Heaven is written: CIA EFATA  $\Gamma CANA$   $\Pi FEANIH$  ENHAVTL ELNA (ill. 3c). Towards Heaven approach the righteous led by St. Peter, who with his right hand unlocks the gate, and in his left hand holds a half-open scroll that identifies him as Christ's Apostle ( $\Pi CTFA$   $A\Pi CAL$  HCL  $\chi \Gamma CTO$ ). Beside him are St. Paul ( $\Pi A$ ) with scrolls in his left hand, St. Jacob (IKOE), St. John the Theologian ( $I \Theta \ E E$ ), and then St. Matthew ( $\overline{M} \Phi$ ) behind whom are St. Bartholomew ( $E F \Phi$ ) and St. Simon (CM). In the continuation of the procession on the foreground are St. Luke ( $\overline{AK}$ ) and St. Mark ( $M \Gamma K$ ). All four Evangelists, apart from the physiognomic characteristics and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> For the various groups of the righteous within the composition of the Last Judgement in many examples, see: Millet G., *La Dalmatique du Vatican. Les élus. Images et croyances*, Paris 1945, 82-91. In earlier examples, the separation of the righteous of a higher social status is noted in Tutin (Симић-Лазар Д., *Иконографија Страшног суда*, 173, сл. 1) and in Vitkuk, thus as a separate group behind the poor are included in Lazaropole (Тричковска J., *Страшниот суд во цр. Св. Ѓорѓи*, 224, п. 74).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Сf. Тричковска J., Страшниот суд во цр. Св. Ѓорѓи, 220, 224, ill. 3-4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Their inscriptions in Banjani are damaged and unreadable.



Ill. 6. The devils tormenting and leading to hell a group of sinners, church of St. George in Banjani (1846)

inscriptions, are also recognized by the closed gospels in their hands. Behind them are the Apostles St. Thomas ( $\overline{\Phi}M$ ) and St. Philip ( $\overline{\Phi}\overline{A}\overline{I}$ ). Next to the Evangelists is the forefather Adam  $(\mathbf{A}\underline{A})$ , while behind him is the hermit St. Onuphrius ( $\Theta N \delta$ ). The last in the line on the front row is another hermit with a damaged inscription, but judging by his garment woven with palm leaves and the broad straw cap on his head, he is St. Paul of Thebes.<sup>22</sup> In the second row behind the Apostles St. Paul and St. John the Theologian are the holy fathers St. John Chrysostom ( $\overline{IQ}$   $\overline{2A}$ ) and St. Spyridon (CITH), while behind them is St. Nicholas  $(\overline{NK})$  from whom only part of the face and the crown are visible. Near the walls of Heaven, there is a figure of a monk with a damaged inscription, and the rest are marked only with nimbuses (ill. 4).

The Holy Mother of God since the earliest examples is almost always present and dominant in Heaven. Also, the figure of the Righteous Thief is almost constant, which is derived from Christ's words: "Truly I tell you, today you will be with me in paradise" (Luke 23:43).<sup>23</sup>As for the representations of the three forefathers who are sporadically represented in different ages from an older to a younger man, in our example, all three are depicted as elders.<sup>24</sup> Certain fading of the figures make it difficult to identify the personification of the souls of the righteous who are usually portrayed as babies in swaddling clothes or only their heads are visible. Nevertheless, despite the fading, they were presented on the lap of one of the figures or were left out, and were replaced by a separate group of children beside the forefathers.<sup>25</sup> The representations of children as a separate group are often depicted on paper icons.<sup>26</sup>

The four rivers flowing from Heaven have their literary source in Genesis 1:10-14. According to St. Epiphanius, a bishop of Salamis in Cyprus (4<sup>th</sup> century), St. Ephrem the Syrian (4th century), the Map of the World from "Christian Topography" by the sixth century geographer Cosmas Indicopleustes, and also according to other authors and texts, their springs

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> On the iconography of one of the first Christian hermits, St. Paul of Thebes, see Спахиу J., *Сликарството во наосот на северниот параклис на Топличкиот манастир*, Патримониум.МК 10 (2012), 235-236, n. 107-111 (with bibliography and examples).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> The figures of the Holy Mother of God and the Righteous Thief in the Garden of Eden appear since the earliest standardized representations of the Last Judgement, cf. Давидов-Темерински А., *Циклус Страшног суда*, in: Зидно сликарство манастира Дечана. Грађа и студије, Београд1995, 203.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Such is the example with their representations in the church of St. George in Lazaropole, cf. Тричковска J., *Страшниот суд во цр. Св. Ѓорѓи*, 226, ill. 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Dicho Zograf in his Hermeneia writes that next to Abraham small children should be presented which should be inscribed as "virgins", see Василиев А., *Ерминии. Технология и иконография*, 118.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Papastratos D., *Paper Icons: Greek Orthodox reli*gious engravings, 1665-1899, Vol. I, Athens 1990, 87-93.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> *The Christian Topography of Cosmas, an Egyptian Monk.* Translated from the Greek, and Edited with Notes and Introduction (ed. J. W. McCrindle), London 1897, 41;



Ill. 7. The General Resurrection, church of St. George in Banjani (1846)

are in the Garden of Eden.<sup>27</sup> Although known from early Christian art before the complete formation of the image of the Last Judgment,<sup>28</sup> their absence in the Byzantine representations of the theme is noted.<sup>29</sup> The inclusion of the four rivers within the Last Judgement is considered to be a post-Byzantine innovation,<sup>30</sup> and the iconographic scheme will remain unchanged even in the later examples. The inscription on the Gate of Heaven which allows only the righteous is considered to be an author's addition in his Hermeneia,<sup>31</sup> but we note a similar inscription earlier

<sup>28</sup> Maguire H., *Op. cit.*, 23-29, 37, 43, 45-48, 51-52, 55, 77, 90, 94; Hachlili R., *Ancient Mosaic Pavements. Themes, Issues and Trends*, Leiden – Boston 2009, 180-183. Numerous illustrations showing the four rivers are available on: *Notes on the Four Rivers of Paradise in Romanesque and pre-Romanesque Art*, http://green-man-of-cercles.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/Four-Rivers-draft-Sept-21.pdf (accessed February 9, 2018).

<sup>29</sup> Грозданов Ц., *Страшниот суд во црквата Свети* Климент, 56.

<sup>30</sup> Грозданов Ц., Страшниот суд во црквата Свети Климент, 56; Серафимова А., Семиотичка анализа и поствизантиски паралели, 184.

<sup>31</sup> Иванова Т., Страшния съд според Ерминиите, 12.

<sup>32</sup> Поповска-Коробар, В., Сликарството на западната фасада, 155, п. 53. in the Monastery of Slivnitsa (1613/14).<sup>32</sup> St. Peter, the leader of the righteous who will enter the Garden of Eden, is depicted with the Keys of the Kingdom of Heaven according to Matthew 16:19. Right next to him is St. Paul, while behind them is the group of apostles, bishops, forefathers, monks and hermits.<sup>33</sup>

## The Weighing of Souls (Psychostasia)

Underneath the Prepared Throne is the Weighing of Souls with the Scales of Justice (AWG MEPHTL ΠΡΑΒΟ MPIAO) (ill. 5). The Hand of God (PVKA ΓCANA) holds the scales with two pans, with an object of a circular shape on the left pan, while on the right pan there are open scrolls on which the deeds of man are written. Among the scales a figure is shown with larger dimensions with a perizoma around the thighs and crossed arms on the chest as a personification of the Soul. Beside her is a group of kneeling people in colorful clothes with the same gesture, as a personification of the souls of the righteous who will be in the hands of God, and the unjust who will suffer (ПРАВЕДНЫ ДШЕ ВРУЦЕ БЖЇН, НЕПРАВЕДНЫ СНЕІТСА НХЪ M&KA). Nearby two birds with human legs and hands in their beaks are depicted, above which is written:

Maguire H., *Earth and Ocean: The Terrestrial World in Early Byzantine Art*, The Pennsylvania State University Press 1987, 17-18, 23, 26, 37, fig. 13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Dicho Zograf in his Hermeneia noted that the group behind St. Peter should be consisted of all apostles, bishops, martyrs, righteous, prophets and kings, see Василиев А., *Ерминии. Технология и иконография*, 118.



Ill. 8 a). The Personification of Hades, Satan, sinners, and the Tollbooths within the Fiery River; b) The Aerial Tollbooths (Mytarstvo) within the Fiery River, detail; c) Satan holding a rake, Judas, cup of flames and the chains with the sinners, detail, church of St. George in Banjani (1846)

**ΠΤΗЦЫ ΔΑЮΤЪ, ΠΛΟΤΗ ΊΛΕ**Υ€СКΗ. Under the birds there are open graves from which the dead resurrect (Μ€**ΓΤΕΪΗ ΕΟ**С**Τ**ΑЮ**ΤЪ Η3Ъ** Γ**ΓΟБΟΕЪ**), and the years of death are written on the crosses, although not all are legible: 184(?), 1842, 1845 and 1846.

On the left side of the scale, an angel is depicted carrying the souls for valuation of their deeds on the scales of justice (AFFA' AYIII NOCH NA CYA H MPABOS MEPIAO). To the left are the Archangels Michael (M) and Gabriel ( $\Gamma$ ) stabbing the devils on the opposite side with spears. The Archangel Michael is depicted as an archistratege with a short tunic, armor and a red cloak, while of Archangel Gabriel only the head, wings and a long dark blue cloak are visible. One of the devils in his arms and around his waist carries scrolls, while the other two pull the right pan of the scales toward them with a hook. A devil is shown dragging a harlot's hair (EANAHLILA) and piercing her with a rake beneath the chest, while another devil rides a figure of a miller with a millstone tied to its neck (BOAGNIYAP' TO AXA AIABOA'). The third devil torments and leads to hell (GASK' AIABOA' NOCIT' EO AAL) a group of grieving and anxious sinners bound in chains (ГРЪШНН ВО АДЪ ХОДНТЪ) (ill. 6).

The righteous weighing of souls of the living is according to Job (31:6) and Daniel (5:27), while the books/lists and the judgement of the dead by what was written in them, according to their deeds, is mentioned in the Revelation (20:12). The motif of the weighing of souls that has a long tradition derived from Egyptian mythology and art, with certain modifications and adaptations becomes an inseparable part of the Last Judgment.<sup>34</sup> The scales of justice have a dominant central place, usually underneath the Prepared Throne, and in most of the examples, Archangel Michael holds them. Although the Bible does not mention his role as a weigher of souls,<sup>35</sup> the Archangel is depicted even in the earliest represantations of this composition.<sup>36</sup> The other variant, as in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> For the sources and the iconography of this motif, cf. Покровскій Н. В., Страшный судъ въ памятникахъ византійскаго и русскаго искусства, Труды VI археологическаго съвзда въ Одессъ (1884 г.), томъ III (1887), 343-347; Давидов-Темерински А., Циклус Страшног суда, 204; Серафимова А., Семиотичка анализа и поствизантиски паралели, 179; Giakoumis K., "Textual visuality & Visual Textuality in Texts Correlated with Artworks. Nektarios Terpos' Pistis and Last Judgement Scenes from Muzeqe, central Albania", in: Текстове, надписи, образи/Texts, Inscriptions, Images, Art Readings. Thematic annual peer-reviwed edition in Art Studies in two volumes 2016/vol. 1 – Old Art, София 2017,230-231.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Покровскій Н. В., *Ор. сіт.*, 345-356.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Давидов-Темерински А., Циклус Страшног суда, 204.



Ill.9 a). Archangel (Michael) and Moses; b) The group of Jews, the Four Kingdoms and the four animals, church of St. George in Banjani (1846)

this case, shows the hand of God holding the scales, which emphasizes the symbolism of the righteous judgement equal to every person according to their deeds, as confirmed by the inscriptions.

The textual models for the resurrection of the dead from the graves are found in John 5:28-29; Epistle to the Philippians 3:11, and Revelation 20:13. It is interesting that on the graves are written the years of the death of the deceased (1842-1846), in a time close to the painting of the narthex. In the struggle between good and evil, the most striking are the representations of the devils that are shown anthropomorphically with black bodies with wings, horns, tails, claws and flaming tongues.<sup>37</sup> From the sinners tormented by the devils are depicted the harlot and the miller who has stolen flour, while the larger group is only labeled as sinners without identifying/determining their sins.

### The General resurrection

Nearby are elements of the *General resurrection* where two angels with trumpets enliven the dead. The first angel blows a trumpet waking the dead from the earth (ATTA'L TPXEN'L B'L 3@MAHO). Under the angel's figure, the personification of the Earth/Gaia (3@MAH) is depicted sitting on the top of a building. Dressed in a blue dress with a red cloak, and a crown on her head, she holds a rock and a sickle in her hands. The second angel blows a trumpet into the sea (ATTA'L TPXEN'L B'L MOP@), while the Personification of the Sea (MOP@) rides a fish. The half-naked female figure is wrapped in a red cloak, with a crown on her head, and holds a sailboat in her left hand. On the sea sur-

face between the various species of fish that return the dead, at the corners four small heads puffing and blowing symbolize the four winds Boreas (BOF(A) – the cold northern wind, Eurus (EFOC) – the eastern wind, Zephyrus (3(AHA) – the western wind, and Notus (NOTOC) - the warm southern wind (ill. 7).<sup>38</sup>

With this the announcement of the resurrection through the angelic trumpets is literally illustrated, as well as the four winds in the Gospel of Matthew 24:31: "And he shall send his angels with a great sound of a trumpet, and they shall gather together his elect from the four winds, from one end of heaven to the other." The textual models for the resurrection of the dead with angelic trumpets are also found in 1 Corinthians 15:52, and 1 Thessalonians 4:16.<sup>39</sup> The personification of the Sea has a more pristine appearance,<sup>40</sup> while the Earth can be depicted sitting on the ground or on an animal, holding a cloth/heavenly oval, a sceptre, a rock, a snake or another object.<sup>41</sup> In this example, a rare presentation of the personification of the Earth sitting on a building with a gable roof

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> For the appearance of the demons in post-Byzantine period, see: Garidis M.K., *Etudes sur le Jugement dernier post-byzantine du XVe à la fin du XIXe siècle. Iconogra-phie – Esthetique*, Thessaloniki 1985, 31-62.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Dicho Zograf in his Hermeneia points the names of the four winds, but does not give a recommendation on how to paint them, see Василиев А., *Ерминии. Технология и иконография*, 119.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Сf. Давидов-Темерински А., *Циклус Страшног* суда, 195.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> For the presentations of the Personification of the Sea, see Тодић Б., *Грачаница. Сликарство*, Београд-Приштина 1988, 162.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Давидов-Темерински А., *Циклус Страшног* суда, 199; Серафимова А., *Семиотичка анализа и по-ствизантиски паралели*, 177 (with bibliography and examples).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Dicho Zograf in his Hermeneia suggests that the personification of the Earth should ride an animal, and from the attributes he only mentions the sickle, see Василиев А., *Ерминии. Технология и иконография*, 119.



Ill. 10a) The prophet Elijah and the righteous Enoch as two witnesses of the Antichrist and Elijah and Enoch are killed by the Antichrist; b) Archangel Michael slaying the Antichrist, church of St. George in Banjani (1846)

is illustrated.<sup>42</sup> This motif will be further used by Avram Dichov, as can be seen in the Last Judgement from the church of St. Elijah in Melnica, Mariovo (1881).<sup>43</sup>

The inclusion of the personification of the winds begins during the 14<sup>th</sup> century shown as (half)figures with trumpets.<sup>44</sup> and the literary source is found in the passage from Daniel's vision of the four beasts (Daniel 7:2),<sup>45</sup> but also in Matthew 24:31. The four winds in the same manner as in Banjani are depicted in several monuments from the post-Byzantine period.<sup>46</sup> As for the inscriptions, in the Last Judgement from the church of St. Holy Mother of God Peribleptos in Ohrid (last quarter of the 16th century) only one representation of the wind with the inscription Livas ( $\Lambda$ ( $\alpha\beta\alpha\zeta$ ) is preserved,<sup>47</sup> which is equal to the Mediterranean southwestern warm wind blowing from Libya. In the church of Panagia tou arhonta Apostolaki (1605/06), some of the inscriptions of the four winds are legible.<sup>48</sup> In the second wall-painting layer from the Church of the Nativity in Arbanassi (1649), the inscription Notus (N $\delta\tau$ o $\zeta$ ) is preserved,<sup>49</sup> while in the exonarthex of the Vatopedi monastery only the name Zephyrus (Zέφυρο $\zeta$ ).<sup>50</sup> From the available examples, we note the complete names of all four winds previously in Lazaropole.<sup>51</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Цветковски С., *Живописот на Дичо Зограф*, 221, ill. 28 on p. 249.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> The oldest example of the four winds are preserved in the Snetogorsky Monastery near Pskov – 1313 (Сарабьянов В.Д., Смирнова Э.С., История древнерусской живописи, Моска 2007, ill. 290), and after that in Dragalevci – 1476/77 (Суботиќ Г., Охридската сликарска школа од XV век, Охрид 1980, sk. 94-96, sk. 104) and in Kremikovci - 1493 (Паскалева-Кабаданева К., Църквата "Св. Георги" в Кремиковския манастир, София 1980, ill. 67-68).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Сf. Симић-Лазар Д., Иконографија Страшног суда, 177.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Their representations are identical in Peribleptos (Василески А., Визијата на пророкот Даниил за Четирите царства (Дан. 7: 1-14) во поствизантиските претстави на Страшниот суд на територијата на Република Македонија, in: Słowiańskie teksty kultury. Samokowskie kontynuacje II, Pozńan – Prilep 2015, 92-93), in Kuchevishte (Серафимова А., Семиотичка анализа и поствизантиски паралели, 177-178, ill. 1, 4), in St. Nicholas of Theologina church in Kastoria (Пеλεκανιδου Σ., Каστορια Ι. Βυζαντιναι Τοιχογραφιαι, Θεσσαλονικη 1953, πιν. 261β), Panagia tou arhonta Apostolaki and also Panagia in the Agios Anargyros district, both in Kastoria (Παϊσιδου Μ.Π., Οι τοιχογραφίες του 17ουαιώνα στους ναούς της Καστοριάς. Συμβολήσ τημ ελέτη. της

μνημειακής ζωγραφικής της Δυτικής Μακεδονίας, Αθήνα 2002, πιν. 77, πιν. 80), in Arbanasi (from personal notes), in Tutin (Симић-Лазар Д., Иконографија Страшног суда, 177, ill. 1, 8) and in Kostinci (Василески А., Визијата на пророкот Даниил, 93, сл. 8).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> The inscription is noted by: Василески А., *Визијата на пророкот Даниил*, 92-93.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Παϊσιδου Μ.Π., *Op. cit.*, πιν. 77.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Notus is referred to as the name of the personification of the Sea in: Пенкова Б., ,,*Арбанашкият Страшен съд от XVIII век от Националния исторически музей в София*", in: Любен Прашков, реставратор и изкуствовед, София 2006, 87.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Horlbeck F.R., *Last Judgement Fresco in the Vatopedi Outer Narthex*, in: Holy Mountain: Icons from Mount Athos and Photographs by Frank Horlbeck, https://holymountain.omeka.net/items/show/16 (accessed February 16, 2018).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> We noted the four winds and their inscriptions on a illustration in the article about the Last Judgement in Lazaropole (Тричковска J., *Страшниот суд во цр. Св. Ѓорѓи*, ill. 11).

### The Fiery River

The Fiery River on the right side of the composition is one of the most picturesque and most characteristic depictons of the Last Judgement in Banjani (PEKA OFNENA BCA FPEWNH NOXPETL) (ill. 8a, b, c). Due to the flat ceiling, we are not able to accurately determine its source, but it probably came out of Christ's feet. Painted as a red mass with flames and waves, there are various sinners depicted in a monochrome manner, tied in chains and pushed by the devils with rakes. On the upper part a figure with larger dimensions than the others was represented, from which only the legs are visible. Further on are the murderers (VEHUH) and the magicians (MACHCTPI),shown as a family with a woman in folk costume, and then Caiaphas with a crown (KAÏAAA) and a devil dragging him by his beard.<sup>52</sup> Among the damned are other historical figures such as Constantine V/Copronymus (KONCTANT KONPONIA), the kings Ahab (AXAABL) and Jeroboam (IGFOEOAMIL), and high-ranking representatives of the clergy (MANAPHTL, ÏGPGA, APXIGPGH, ΔHAKONЪ). Next to them there is a naked male figure with a slightly raised arm, but without an inscription.

The Fiery River ends with open jaws of Hades depicted as a beast (AA BC AA, where Satan (CATANA H AIABOA) stands holding a rake and Judas (I8AA) with a bag of coins on one hand, while with the other raised hand holds a cup of flames and the chains with the damned. From the mouth of Satan comes out a text written in a reversed manner:  $\Pi PIAHT \in AP83H BO$  OFIN CMENE (ill. 8a, c).

The Fiery River, which is an integral part of all compositions of the Last Judgement, has its literary source in the books of prophets Isaiah 66:2 and Daniel 7:10, while in Revelation 21:8 is described as "a fiery lake of burning sulfur". In contrast to the simpler appearance of the Fiery River in medieval examples, certain changes have been noted in the course of the 18<sup>th</sup> century,<sup>53</sup> while more realistic presentations are particularly dominant in 19<sup>th</sup> century compositions.<sup>54</sup> With regard to the various categories of sinners in the whirlpool of the Fiery River, in our example the wrongful ones are consigned, some of them as mentioned in the texts of St. Cyril of Alexandria, St. Ephrem the Syrian, the Life of St. Basil the New<sup>55</sup>,

and the Revelation 21:8. Further on, our attention is drawn by the family, followed by the inscription magicians which, unlike the other Slavic inscriptions, is a Greek word, but in this case transliterated in Cyrillic. The same word that is not encountered in the monuments of Greek language provenance, is written beside one of the figures in the Fiery River from the church of St. George in Lazaropole<sup>56</sup>. At the same time, the woman in folk costume resembles the women depicted in the scenes Visiting a Fortune teller, Witchcraft and the Woman Magician, often included within the composition of the Last Judgement. Dicho Zograf could have been introduced to this theme during his early stay in Bulgaria,<sup>57</sup> which was very popular there by the beginning of the nineteenth century.

Among the sinners in the Fiery River historical figures such as Herod (with Herodias and Salome), Pontius Pilate, Diocletian, Maximian, Julian the Apostate, Constantine V and others are often included.<sup>58</sup> In the Fiery River in Banjani the infamous Byzantine emperor Constantine V, and the kings Ahab and Jeroboam are portrayed.<sup>59</sup> The figure with larger dimensions or

<sup>57</sup> Василиев А,. Социални и патриотични теми, 71-81.

<sup>58</sup> Покровскій Н. В., Ор. cit., 316, 375-376; Krauze-Kołodziej A., "And they will throw them into the fiery furnace, where there will be weeping and gnashing of teeth" (Mt 13,42). The Representation of Divine Justice in Latin and Byzantine Iconography of the Last Judgement - Part I, Studia Anthropologica. The borderlands of art history and culture, vol. 2 (2017), 259-276. One of the earliest examples of the inclusion of historical figures among sinners are the representations of Herod and Herodias in the Last Judgement from the church of St. George near Kouvaras in Attica (13th century), cf. Mouriki D., An Unusual Representation of the Last Judgment in a Thirteenth Century Fresco at St. George near Kouvarasin Attica, Δελτίον XAE 8 (1975-1976), 157-158, ill. 87. In the composition of the Snetogorsky Monastery near Pskov (1313), besides Herod, Herodias and Salome, are included Severus, Arius, Nestor, Origen, Diocletian, and others, cf. Сарабьянов В.Д., «Страшный Суд» в росписях Снетогорского монастыря в Пскове и его литературная основа, Проблеми на изкуството 2 (1996), 28-29. In Macedonian post-Byzantine examples, as in the Last Judgement of the Monastery of Slivnitsa (1613/14), only Herod is depicted in the Fiery River (cf. Василески А., Поствизантиските претстави на Страшниот суд на територијата на Република Македонија, Магистерски труд, Филозофски факултет - Скопје, 2015, 127; Поповска-Коробар В., Сликарството на западната фасада, 153), while later in Lazaropole, the emperors Diocletian and Maximian are included (cf. Тричковска J., Страшниот суд во цр. Св. Ѓорѓи, 230, ill. 10). 315-317.

<sup>59</sup> Dicho Zograf in his Hermeneia within the Fiery River

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Dicho Zograf in his Hermeneia has stated that Caiaphas with a devil pulling his beard, should lead the Jews behind Moses (Василиев А., *Ерминии. Технология и иконография*, 119), but in our example he is depicted in the Fiery River.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Покровскій Н. В., *Ор. сіт.*, 369.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> For more examples, see Василиев А., Социални и патриотични теми в старото българско изкуство, София 1973, 19, 21, 25, 27, 31, 43.

<sup>55</sup> Василиев А,. Социални и патриотични теми,

<sup>363, 368;</sup> Симић-Лазар Д., Иконографија Страшног суда, п. 67-69.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Тричковска Ј., Страшниот суд во цр. Св. Ѓорѓи, 230.



Ill. 11a) The Wheel of Life; b) The Sacred Confession; c) and d) Individual punishments and dark torments of the sinners

the one with a slightly raised arm, on the other hand, may have represented the rich man who during his agony in hellfire, demanded from Abraham a water to cool his tongue, derived from the Parable of the Rich Man and Lazarus (Luke 16:19-25).<sup>60</sup>

The most striking part of the Fiery River is the personification of Hades depicted as the head of a monster with open jaws, which had it earliest appearance in the Monastery of Great Lavra (c. 1535).<sup>61</sup>

From it arises the ruler of the underworld accompanied by the inscription Satan and Devil, derived from Revelation 12:9. The winged representation of Satan resembles the other devils, but differs by his much larger dimensions.<sup>62</sup> The text written in a reversed manner, inviting the sinners to join him in the infernal fire, is exceptional and so far we have not noticed it on other examples.

# The Serpent and the Aerial Tollbooths

Within the Fiery River from the jaws of the beast comes out a long tongue that ends with a serpent's head, accompanied with the inscription *Tollbooths or Mytarstvo (ordeals)* (MLITAPCTEO) (ill. 8c). Along the serpents body where the devils ride, there is a long

included the emperors who tormented saints: Constanine V, Jualin (the Apostate?), Maximian, Diocletian and Ahab, see Василиев А., *Ерминии. Технология и иконография*, 119. In our example he did not portray Julian the Apostate, Maximian and Diocletian, but replaced them with Caiaphas and Jeroboam.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> For the rich man condemned to hell, see Давидов-Темерински А., *Циклус Страшног суда*, 204-205. In Lazaropole this figure is accompanied by the inscription "ruthless rich man", cf. Тричковска J., *Страшниот суд во цр. Св. Ѓорѓи*, 229.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Серафимова А., *Семиотичка анализа и поствизантиски паралели*, 181-182, заб. 115. For different personifications of Hades, see: Garidis M.K., *Etudes sur le* 

Jugement dernier; 63-81; Антонов Д.И., Майзульс М.Р., Анатомия ада. Путеводитель по древнерусской визуальной демонологии, Москва 2013, 117-124, 139-143.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> For the various representations of Satan, see: Антонов Д.И., Майзульс М.Р., *Демоны и грешники в древнерусской иконографии: Семиотика образа*, Москва 2011, 35-43, 57-66; Idem, Анатомия ада, 144-150.

scroll with twenty various types of sins: 1. Greed ( $\Lambda$ 4KOMCTEO,), 2. Lie ( $\Lambda$ LML,), 3. Condemning (0CMM  $\Delta$ ENIE,), 4. Overating ( $\Pi$ FEBOSFO $\Delta$ ENIE,), 5. Witchcraft ( $\Pi$ 4FO $\Delta$ EHCTEIE,), 6. Banditry (F43EOHCTEO,), 7. Envy (34EHCTL), 8. Miserliness (CKSIIOCTL), 9. Gluttony (0ELA $\Delta$ ENIE,), 10. Injustice ( $\Pi$ FIFAE $\Delta$ A,), 11. Incest (KFOEOCMENIE,), 12. Rage ( $\Lambda$ FOCTL), 13. Pride ( $\Gamma$ 0F $\Delta$ 0CTL), 14. Avarice (CFEEFO $\Lambda$ IOEIE,), 15. Heresy ( $\Pi$ F43HOC $\Lambda$ OEIE), 16. Murder ( $\Delta$ SUEFSEICTEO), 17. Despair ( $\ddot{C}$  $\Pi$ 4 $\Lambda$ NL), 18. Anger ( $\Gamma$ NEEL), 19. Fornication ( $E\Lambda$ STL), 20. Drunkenness ( $\Pi$ HANCTEO).

The main idea of the Aerial Tollbooths is the result of the soul's examination after death, and judgement in the presence of angels and devils, in order to determine its good deeds or sins. Devils take charges for sins against good deeds, while angels who are accompanying the soul defend its innocence.<sup>63</sup> The direct literary source for the deriving of the theme is The Life of St. Basil the New (+944), in fact the vision of his disciple Gregory for the aerial tollbooths through which the soul of the old woman Theodora passes in the aftermath of her death<sup>64</sup>. The theme appears as a separate cycle or is incorporated within the Last Judgement. The earliest appearance of the second variant was in Russia during the 15<sup>th</sup> century with the inclusion of a huge serpent with twenty or twenty-one stations/rings of separate sins.<sup>65</sup> On the territory of present-day Romania representations of the Tollbooths can be found in different regions from 16<sup>th</sup> century and further on,<sup>66</sup> while in Bulgaria we find them from 18th and 19th centuries.67

On the territory of the Republic of Macedonia, Dicho Zograf introduced the Russian variant of the Tollbooths for the first time in Banjani, although he does not mention it at all in his hermeneias. Following his example, this version of the Tollbooths will be depicted in the church of the Holy Mother of God in Drslajca, Struga (1875) painted by his sons Avram and Spiridon (Spire),<sup>68</sup> in the church of St. Elijah in Selci,<sup>69</sup> in the church of St. Elijah in Melnica, Mariovo (1881) painted by Avram Dichov,<sup>70</sup> in the church of St. Joachim Osogovski (1884) painted by Avram Dichov, Miron Iliev and Gregory Petrov,<sup>71</sup> and also in the church of St. Paraskevi in Velgoshti (1890),<sup>72</sup> although the list can be expanded with more examples.

In the last decades of the 19<sup>th</sup> century, the serpent began to be represented in a different and simplified variant with smaller dimensions, without the wrapped scroll, but with an apple in its jaws. The serpent is turned towards Eve, which can be associated with the Original sin, derived from Genesis 3:1-6. We note the so-called "Serpent of Eve" in the Fiery River of the Last Judgement in the church of St. Nicholas in Nebregovo, near Prilep (1882),<sup>73</sup> in the church of St. John the Baptist in the Monastery of Slepche (1889), and in the church of St. Nicholas/The Prophet Jeremiah in Gorni Disan, near Negotino (19<sup>th</sup> century).<sup>74</sup>

On the other hand, the separate cycle of the Tollbooths, which is still within the reduced variant of the Last Judegment, is recorded on our territory in the porch of the old church of the Holy Mother of God in the Monastery of St. Panteleymon in the village Panteley, near Kochani (1872), painted by Zachary Dospevski<sup>75</sup> and in the church of St. Nicholas (St.

<sup>72</sup> I express my deep gratitude to my dear colleague Ivona Pandzak-Pineva, MA who pointed out this example.

<sup>73</sup> Грозданов Ц., "*Црквата Свети Никола во Небрегово, Прилепско*", in: Уметноста и културата на XIX век во Западна Македонија: Студии и прилози, Скопје 2004, 316, 319-320.

<sup>74</sup> On this occasion, I express my deep gratitude to my dear colleague Mirjana M. Mashnich who informed me about these two examples, as well as for the provided photo documentation.

<sup>75</sup> Василиев А., *Български възрожденски майстори*, 426, ill. 239; Idem, *Социални и патриотични теми*, 78. Only fourteen scenes have been preserved in the separate cycle of the Tollbooths in Panteley, while the rest have been damaged. In addition to the reduced variant of the Last Judgement, in the porch are also depicted the scenes Visit-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Иванова Т., Митарствата на душата в иконографията на Страшния съд, Проблеми на изкуството 4 (2013), 25.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Rydén L, *The Life of St. Basil the Younger and the Date of the Life of St. Andreas Salos*, Harvard Ukrainian Studies 7 (1983), 568-586; Every G., *Toll Gates on the Air Way*, Eastern Churches Review 8 (1976), 139-151; *The Oxford Dictionary of Byzantium* (ed. by Alexander P. Kazhdan), Vol. I., Oxford 1991, 270-271, 593; Goldfrank D.M., *Who Put the Snake on the Icon and the Tollbooths on the Snake? – A Problem of Last Judgment Iconography, Harvard Ukrainian Studies 19 (1995), 180; Himka J., Last Judgment Iconography in the Carpathians*, University of Toronto Press, 2009, 18-19, 47-53.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> Goldfrank D. M., *Op.cit.*, 188-193; Berezhnaya L., *Sub Specie Mortis. Ruthenian and Russian Last Judgement Icons Compared*, European Review of History/Revue européenne d'histoire, Vol. 11, No. 1, 8-17.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> Betea R., *The Trial of the Soul. Post-Byzantine Visual Representations of the Tollbooths in the Romanian Churches of Maramureş*, Kunsttexte.de/ostblick, No. 4, 2-3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> Генова Е., Цикълът "Митарствата на душата" в българската църковна живопис (текст и изображение), Годишник на Софийския университет, Център за славяно-византийски проучвания "Иван Дуйчев", Т. 96

<sup>(15), 2011, 441-459;</sup> Иванова Т., *Митарствата на дуиата*, 25 (with examples and literature).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Цветковски С., Живописот на Дичо Зограф, 77, 216, 221.

<sup>69</sup> Ibid., 222-223, ill. 24 on p. 246.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Ibid., 221, ill. 28 on p. 249.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> Иванова Т., *Митарствата на душата*, 31, п. 110.



*Ill. 12. Pseudo-icons of Jesus Christ Pantocrator, the Holy Mother of God with Christ, St. John the Forerunner, the patron St. George slaying the Dragon, and St.Demetrios conquering the beast* 

Mother of God) in Rankovce, Kriva Palanka (1885), work of Avram Dichov together with Miron Iliev and Gregory Petrov.<sup>76</sup>

# Unto the resurrection of damnation

On the right side of the composition, the archangel Michael is shown, who points towards the Judge, while holding a scroll with the inscription: **A** COTEOPWIH SAAA, EOCKPEWENIE CYAA. Behind him is Moses with a nimbus and a prophetic hat, leading the group of Jews (GEPGH). While the explanatory text is hidden from the ceiling, only few letters are legible... THE  $\Gamma \widetilde{\Delta} A$ . The prophet with one hand points towards Christ, while with the other hand holds the Stone tablets with the Decalogue and an inscribed scroll which indicates the rebuking of the group: C&H  $CTT FAC[\Pi]ATA[.]O EC3A[E]ONIH(ill. 9a).^77 The group is$ consisted of numerous figures of old and young men dressed as Jewish elders, with characteristic hats and veils on theirs heads. Some of them are plucking their hair and mustache, and by their facial expression most of them are frightened, while three devils stab them with rakes (ill. 9b).

The Archangel is the second God's messenger depicted as a leader of the group of sinners on the left side of the Judge, while the rest of the quote after John 5:29 is inscribed on his scroll ("…and they that have done evil, unto the resurrection of damnation").<sup>78</sup> The representation of Moses with the Jews is another addition which appears earliest in the Snetogorsky Monastery near Pskov (1313),<sup>79</sup> then becomes a favorite episode in the post-Byzantine painting,<sup>80</sup> while prevailing its popularity even during 19<sup>th</sup> century. Otherwise, in the vision of Gregory about the Last Judgement contained in the text of his teacher St. Basil the New, it is stated that Jews who did not have faith in Christ will be condemned to eternal torment along with other unbelievers.<sup>81</sup>

#### Daniel's vision of the Four Kingdoms

Under the representation of the Jews are *the four beasts*; a white bird resembling a four-legged eagle with a crown on its head (**PHMCKOE UFCTEO**), a fantastic bird with four heads with crowns and four legs with leopard strips (**BABIAONCKOE UFCTEO**),<sup>82</sup> a bear (**IEPCKOE UFCTEO**), and a lion (**MAKEACONCKOE UFCTEO**). At the end of the composition are depicted the *Four Pagan kings*, at different age, all in richly decorated imperial clothes and closed crowns. The first one is Poros (**IIF'L IIOFOC'L**) portrayed as a stern old man with a long pointed beard, next to him is Darius (**IIF'L AAFIOC'L**) with a black broad beard, then is Cyrus (**IIF'L KHF'IHOC'L**) with a very short beard, and at the end is

ing a Fortune teller (from personal notes) and the Just and Wrongful Confession joined in one episode without many details (cf. Чокревска-Филип J., Пробивот на темата "Праведно и грешно исповедање" во сликарството во Македонија, Патримониум.МК 3-4/5-6 (2009), 225-226, ill. 8).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> Василиев А., *Социални и патриотични теми*, 78, ill. 72; Генова Е., *Ор. cit.*, 441.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> The admonitory text with which Moses addresses the Jews is complete in Dicho Zograf's Hermeneia, see Василиев А., *Ерминии. Технология и иконография*, 119.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> The same inscription is written on the Archangel Gabriel's scroll in the Last Judgement from the church of St. George in Lazaropole, cf. Тричковска J., *Страшниот суд во цр. Св. Ѓорѓи*, 218, ill. 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> Сf. Сарабьянов В.Д., «Страшный Суд», 24.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> More on the respresentation, the meaning and numerous post-Byzantine examples, see Серафимова А., *Кучевишкиот манастир*, 183-184.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> Сf. Поповић J., *Житија светих за март*, Београд, 1973, 521; Сарабьянов В.Д., *«Страшный Суд»*, 24.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> In the Last Judgement from the church of St. George in Lazaropole, this beast is named Pardalis (cf. Тричковска J., *Страшниот суд во цр. Св. Ѓорѓи*, 232, ill. 9), as stated in the Dicho Zograf's Hermeneia (Василиев А., *Ерминии. Технология и иконография*, 119), which in Latin and Greek means leopard (*Oxford Latin Dictionary* (ed. by P.G.W. Glare), Oxford University Press 1968, 1295).

the beardless Alexander the Great (IFL ANSANAPA), with their bodies and hands tied in chains (ill. 9b).<sup>83</sup>

The visualisation of the Four Kingdoms is based on Daniel's vision (7:1-28) where they are symbolized by the appearance of four beasts: a lion with eagle's wings, a bear with three ribs in its mouth between its teeth, a leopard with four wings of a fowl and four heads, and also a dreadful, terrible and exceedingly strong beast with large iron teeth and ten horns. The earliest representation of the four beasts as a symbol of the Four Kingdoms of the ancient nations that will disappear with the coming of Christ is in the Snetogorsky Monastery near Pskov (1313),<sup>84</sup> and then in Andrei Rublev's paintings in the church of the Assumption Cathedral in Vladimir (1408).85 In the post-Byzantine iconography of the Last Judgement, the parallel presentation of the four beasts together with the four emperors, will begin in the Refectory of the Great Lavra Monastery (c. 1535),86 and after that will appear in different variants with or without the beasts.<sup>87</sup> In our earlier examples of the composition, their joint presentation is recorded in the church of Holy Mother of God Peribleptos in Ohrid (last quarter of the 16<sup>th</sup>century),<sup>88</sup> the Monastery of Slivnitsa (1613/14)<sup>89</sup> and the Monastery of Kuchevishte (1630/31).90

#### Apocalyptic motifs

Under the representations of Moses and the Jews, three scenes related to the prophet Elijah, the righteous Enoch and the Antichrist are depicted. The first scene represents *the prophet Elijah and the righteous Enoch as two witnesses of the Antichrist* (ITFFOK'L HAIA, H ITFEAHLIH GNOX'L CETAHTEACTYET'L 3A

**ANTHXFHCT**) (Revelation 11:3-4).<sup>91</sup> Elijah (HAIA) and Enoch ((NOX)) are seated on clouds with their gestures pointing towards the Antichrist (A[N]THXFHCT). In the second scene *Elijah and Enoch are killed by the Antichrist* (ANTHXFHCT) **NOC**KAGTL **AEA** (**E**CAHTCAH HAÏA H (NOXA). In the center is the Antichrist shown as a middle aged man with brown hair that falls on his shoulders and a short beard, with royal clothes and a crown on his head, while his legs are in the form of animal paws.<sup>92</sup> In the left hand he holds a scabbard and with the sword he cuts off the head of the prophet Elijah (HAIA), while Enoch ((NX)) stands beside him (Revelation 11:7) (ill. 10a).

Underneath, the third scene depicts the Archangel Michael slaying the Antichrist ( $\PXHAFTAL MX VGH$ ANTHXFHCTA) (Revelation 12, 7-10) (ill. 10b). Archangel Michael is shown with a fiery sword in his right hand, and with his left hand holding a sphere with a cross and Christ's monogram ( $\VC XC$  NIKA). The archangel vigorously tramples over the conquered Antichrist (ANTHXFHCTL), shown as in the previous scene with royal clothes, but here as a bald old man. His crown has fallen, while his soul comes out of the mouth accompanied by a devil. Beside the head and the paws of the Antichrist, two more devils are shown, who while fleeing turn their backs towards him.

The scenes belong to the so-called apocalyptic motifs that are inspired by the Revelation of St. John.<sup>93</sup> They illustrate the story of the two witnesses, Elijah and Enoch, who will appear to testify and dissuade the people from the worship of the beast, although few will obey them, after which the beast will come out of the Abyss and shall make war against them, and shall overcome them, and kill them. After the caused strife and devastation, the beast (Antichrist) will be cast out by Archangel Michael. Although the Revelation does not reveal their identities, but they are referred to as "the two witnesses, the two olive trees and the two lampstands", it is considered that the two righteous who ascended into heaven without tasting the death, are indeed Elijah and Enoch,<sup>94</sup> as confirmed by (Pseudo) Ephrem the Syrian in his ser-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> The four pagan emperors are depicted in the same order and description as Dicho Zograf himself recommends in his own Hermeneia, see Василиев А., *Ерминии. Технология и иконография*, 119.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> Сарабьянов В.Д., «Страшный Суд», 25-27.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup> Лазарев В. Н., Андрей Рублев и его школа, Москва 1966, 25, 119, pl. 45; Алпатов М. В., Андрей Рублев, Москва 1972, 52, pl. 34.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> Millet G., *Monuments de l'Athos relevés avec le concours de l'armée française d'Orient et de l'Ecole française d'Athènes*, I. Les Peintures. Album de 264 planches. Ernest Leroux, Paris, 1927), pl. 149/2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> Грозданов Ц., Страшниот суд во црквата Свети Климент, 51; Серафимова А., Семиотичка анализа и поствизантиски паралели, 178-179; Василески А., Визијата на пророкот Даниил, 90-91.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> Грозданов Ц., Страшниот суд во црквата Свети Климент, 51.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> Поповска-Коробар В., Сликарството на западната фасада, 153-154.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> Серафимова А., Семиотичка анализа и поствизантиски паралели, 178-179.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> The inscription differs from the one stated in Dicho Zograf's Hermeneia, see Василиев А., *Ерминии. Технология и иконография*, 119.

 $<sup>^{92}</sup>$  For the image of the Antichrist and especially the balance on the verge of human and demonic in his depictions, see: Антонов Д.И., Майзульс М.Р., *Демоны и грешники*, 169-172.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> Сf. ИвановаТ., *Страшния със според Ерминиите*, 16, п. 72.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> Tabor J.D., "*Returning to the Divinity*": Josephus's Portrayal of the Disappearances of Enoch, Elijah, and-Moses, Journal of Biblical Literature, Vol. 108, No. 2 (1989), 225-238.

mon called "On the Last Times, the Antichrist, and the End of the World".<sup>95</sup> In the recommendations for depiction of the Apocalypse in the *painter's manual* of the Zografski family and the one by Dionysius of Fourna, the chapter 11 briefly states that "Enoch and Elijah are ascending to heaven in clouds".<sup>96</sup>

Dicho Zograf introduced these apocalyptic scenes for the first time in the Last Judgement on the territory of Republic of Macedonia, for which he gave a detailed description in his Hermeneia.97 The depiction of the Antichrist in royal clothes within the Last Judgement, but among the representations of the sinners in Hell, is previously encountered in the Athonite refectories of the monasteries Great Lavra (c. 1535) and Dionysiou (after 1553), and the narthexes of the monasteries Roussanou (1560) and Docheiariou (1567/68).<sup>98</sup> The earliest side by side representation of the prophet Elijah and the righteous Enoch is on the south wall of the narthex of the church of St. George in Veliko Tarnovo (early 17th century). Their figures are in the immediate proximity and in relation to the conceptual context of the Last Judgement, depicted on the eastern wall of the narthex.99

<sup>96</sup> Медић М., *Стари сликарски приручници II*, Београд, 2002, 655; Idem, *Стари сликарски приручници III*, Ерминија о сликарским вештинама Дионисија из Фурне, Београд, 2005, 351.

<sup>97</sup> Василиев А., Ерминии. Технология и иконография, 119.

<sup>98</sup> Chouliaras I. P., *The post-byzantine iconography of the individual punishments of the sinners in the depiction of Hell in Northwestern Greece. Differences and similarities to the Cretan school of painting*, Zograf 40 (2016), 145 (with literature).

<sup>99</sup> I express my special gratitude to the respected colleague Dr Maria Kolusheva, who pointed out this example and provided me with an insight into her doctoral dissertation: Колушева М., Църквата "Св. Георги" във Велико Търново и нейните стенописи, Дисертацияза присъждане на образователната и научна степен доктор, Институт за изследване на изкуствата, София 2016, 208-211. For their representations in this church, and especially their popularity in the Western art, precisely in connection with the composition of the Last Judgement, despite their low presence in this context in Eastern Orthodox churches, see also: Пенкова Б., "Към идейния контекст на Страшния съд в българските паметници от XVI-XVII в. Съпътстващи теми", in: От Честния пояс на Богородица до коланчето за рожба. Изследвания по изкуствознание и културна антропология в чест на проф. Елка Бакалова, София 2010, 51-52, ill. 3.

As far as the apocalyptic scenes from Banjani are concerned, we find similar depictions on two paper icons from the first decades of the 19<sup>th</sup> century,<sup>100</sup> then in the church of St. Nicholas in Rayovo near Samokov (1837), the work of Kiriazis Konstantinu,<sup>101</sup> and also on a 19<sup>th</sup> century icon from the Regional Museum of History in Veliko Tarnovo.<sup>102</sup> Unlike Banjani, we note the depiction of the Archangel slaying the Antichrist as an episode included within the Fiery River in the church of St. George in Lazaropole.<sup>103</sup> According to our research, the apocalyptic motifs developed through three scenes would not be repeated in other examples in the Republic of Macedonia.

# The Wheel of Life

Beside the Fiery River and underneath the General resurrection is the illustration of the The Wheel of Life (ill. 11a). The wheel on the inner side is divided into eight parts marked with certain letters and numbers, and on the outerside there are eight half-length figures of a person in different stages of life. The circle of life begins with a ten-year old child, marked with the number 10 and the letter  $\tilde{I}$ . In the following parts are presented a young man at the age of twenty with the number 20 and the letter  $\tilde{K}$ , and an adult man of thirty years of age with the number 30 and the letter  $\Lambda$ . At the top of the wheel is depicted a man in emperors clothes with a crown on his head, holding a sceptre in his left hand, and a cross in his right hand. His age, which is considered to be the peak of wisdom and intellect, is marked with the number 40 and with the letter M, and above it an inscription is inscribed: «ГДА БНЕАЮТЪЧЛЕКЪ НА ЕРЪХЪТА МУДРНН СН ... **AOEPH PAZYMNIH**, while underneath is written: **ATTA FA38MENI TABK8**. Further on is an older man with gray hair and a short beard, and below him the number 50 and the letter  $\tilde{N}$ . The next two figures of elderly man with longer beards are shown and marked with 60(3)and 70  $(\hat{\mathbf{0}})$ . At the bottom of the wheel is an old man in eighty years of age, perceived as the ultimate stage

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>95</sup> For the texts of Pseudo Ephrem the Syrian, see Hemmerdinger-Iliadou D., *Les données archéologiques dans la version grecque des sermons de saint Éphrem le Syrien*, Cahiers archéologiques, No. 13 (1962), 29-37. For other sources in which the two witnesses are identified as Elijah and Enoch, see Culleton G., *The Reign of Antichrist*, Rockford, 1974, 7, 11, 17, 65-66, 69, 71, 93, 97, 110-111, 124-126.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> Such is the example with the paper icon from Constantinople, dated in 1807, the work of the engravers Parthenios and Gerasimos Karavias of Ithaca, and also the paper icon from Mount Athos, dated in 1840, the work of the hieromonk Daniel who probably used the same cliche from 1807, cf. Papastratos D., op.cit, 86-87, 89, ill. 51, 53.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> Мутафов Е., Гръцката фамилия Константину и художествените процеси в Самоковската митрополия през първата половина на XIX в., Проблеми на изкуството 4 (2010), 36-39, ill. on p. 38.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup> Иванова Т., *Митарствата на душата*, ill. on p. 31.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> For the episode from Lazaropole is stated that it presents an "angel piercing a figure of an unknown ruler (in emperors clothes with a crown on his head) ...", cf. Тричковска J., *Страшниот суд во цр. Св. Ѓорѓи*, 229, ill. 10.

of life, marked with the letter  $\tilde{\Pi}$ , with his head towards the open grave (**FFOGL**) and underneath is written: KOFA **EHAXGTL**  $\tilde{\Pi}$ **AEKL** NA : 80 : AGTL OVEAA3HTL BO FFOIL. Close to the wheel there is another open grave (**FFOGL**) where the skeleton stands as the personification of Death (CMGFTL). The Grim Reaper has a winged head with a closed book between the wings, while holding a scythe in his hands. Next to the skeleton's head is written: CIA CMGFTL  $\tilde{\Pi}$ AEKA SMHFAIOTL, and beside his feet there is an ax, a hammer, a saw, a spear and a hook, marked as tools of death (XAATH  $\tilde{\Box}$  CMGFT).

This composition belongs to the themes with moralizing-didactic character which reflects the medieval idea of transience of the earthly life and the perception of time as an unstoppable circle. The description of death as a skeleton along with its tools can be found in the vision of Gregory for the death of Theodora,<sup>104</sup> and its personification in art can be found in various creative variants.<sup>105</sup> In the Balkans, the Wheel of Life emerged during the 17th century, and became especially favorite in the 19th century, often included within the Last Judgement.<sup>106</sup> The developed type of the composition is described in details in the Zografski Family's Hermeneia,107 and also in the painters manual by Dionysius of Fourna.<sup>108</sup> Although Dicho Zograf does not give directions in his Hermeneia for painting the theme, he introduced it for the first time in Banjani. After him, on our territory, the composition will be depicted by his sons Avram and Spiridon (Spire) in the church in Drslajca.<sup>109</sup>

### The Sacred Confession

Underneath the Wheel of Life the Sacred Confession (HCHOE&AANIE CHACTHTEANOE) is illustrated (ill. 11b). The priest is sitted on a throne under an arch where there is a censer and a Christ's icon. In front of him is a kneeling young man dressed in red clothes in a moment of confession, while snakes come out of his mouth according to the number of sins. Behind the young man is the devil (AHABOAL) who encourages him not to tell his sins and points to the scroll with the inscription: **NOCFAMHCA NOCFAMHCA NOCFAMHCA FFEX TEOA**. In the background, the guardian angel is grieving because of the unconfessed sins: TOH YABKL дошелъ да се исповеда па неказува сите гръхове затова му нензлазн змната нзъуста колку грехове каза толку змнн нзъблува. Агтлъ храннте[л] плаче за него защо неке да се исповеде.

This is one of the themes that finds a significant place in the painted ensembles on the territory of Republic of Macedonia during the 19<sup>th</sup> century. In it, the act of sacrament of confession is conveyed, or more precisely the act of confessing and admittance of sins to God in the presence of a priest, known as Just and Wrongful Confession.<sup>110</sup> The theme is illustrated as a detailed variant with two episodes, or as a concise version, which is more widespread and usually part of the Last Judgement, as in our case.<sup>111</sup>

#### The Eternal Torments of the Damned

Further on in the lower part of the composition, in a rectangularly shaped space bounded by a frame, are the individual punishments and dark torments of the damned as symbols of particular types of sin, that burn in the eternal fire (ill. 11 c, d). Seven figures of the sinners are depicted wearing waistbands, except for the first figure of the harlot who is completely

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> Поповић Ј., Житија светих за март, 508.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>105</sup> The appearance and the presentation of death in the Western art, as well as in other examples, and especially in the Last Judgement, are available on: Völser I., The Theme of Death in Italian Art: The Triumph of Death, Montréal, 2001; Oosterwijk S., 'Fro Paris to Inglond'? The danse macabre in text and image in late-medieval England, Doctoral Thesis, Leiden University, 2009 (all chapters available via web link: https://openaccess.leidenuniv.nl/ handle/1887/13873); Betea R., "The Death of Sinners is Evil". The Personifications of Death in the Iconography of the Last Judgement in Maramures (17th-19th Centuries), Transylvanian Review, Vol. XX, supplement no. 2:1 (2011), 307-321; Carrade Sh.M., The Black Death in the Medieval World: How Art Reflected the Human Experience Through a Macabre Lens, Senior Theses and Capstone Projects, 41 (2016), 1-44; Symbol Dictionary. Symbols of Death and Time (Western), Symbolsdictionary.Net. http://www.symboldictionary.net?p=2696.htm (accessed February 26, 2018).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>106</sup> For the emergence, the earliest examples, influences, iconographic formulas, literary sources, parallels, semantic elements and the spreading of the theme, see Bakalova E., *The Wheel of Life in 17<sup>th</sup> Century Painting – Iconographic Sources*, ZMSLU 32-33 (2002), 9-19.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>107</sup> Медић М., Стари сликарски приручници II, 668-671.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> Idem, Стари сликарски приручници III, 521-525.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> For the composition Wheel of Life from Banjani, and also in Drslajca, see Цветковски С., *Живописот на Дичо Зограф*, 76-89.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> The appearance, sources, distribution, iconography and variants of the theme, as well as numerous examples, among which is the one from Banjani, see Чокревска-Филип J., "Праведно и грешно исповедување" во црквата Св. Ѓорѓи во Струга", in: Јубилеен зборник - 25 години митрополит Тимотеј, Охрид, 2006, 298, ill. 6; Eadem, Пробивот на темата "Праведно и грешно исповедање", 219-230, ill. 12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>111</sup> A thorough description of the detailed variant of the Sacred Confession is given in the Dicho Zograf's Hermeneia (Василиев А., *Ерминии. Технология и иконография*, 120-121), whose great influence is equally important for the development and spreading of both editions (cf. Чокревска-Филип J., *Пробивот на темата "Праведно и грешно исповедање"*, 221-222, 227-228).

naked. The harlot with chained legs hangs upside down (TEMNA MXKA EA&ANİKЪ), while from the mouth of the slanderer comes out its tongue, and worms eat his flesh (TEMNA MXKA KAEETNİKЪ). The next figure of the usurer is wrapped with snakes (TEMNA MXKA POCTOELIIHKAMЪ), while beside him the female figure of the harlot is tied to the neck and legs, with a snake around her neck (MVKA KENA EA&ANA). Further on is a witchcraft and idolatry woman (MXKA 'HAFOAEEM H HAOAOCAXXÏTEAE), accompanied by a murderer (MXKA AXIIIEXELIEM), while the last two figures are of a drunkard with a snake around his neck (MXKA IHANÏILEM) and a lustful woman tied up by her arms and legs (MXKA IFCAIOEOAEEMЪ).

The complex image of the individual punishments that evolves during the 12th century and continues until the 14th century,<sup>112</sup> becomes a constant within the post-Byzantine depictions of the Last Judgement, and has its continuity during the 19th century.<sup>113</sup> The visual representation of the eternal torments has a moralizing-didactic character. Its main role is to warn, discipline, and to keep the believers from sinning and straying away from the God's path.<sup>114</sup> Dicho Zograf in the chapter "The dark torment of the unconfessed - devils devour them" in his Hermeneia, listed and described several categories of sinners and their torments.<sup>115</sup> In the individual punishments from Banjani few sin(ner)s are missing, such as thieves, liars, traitors, and the couple who sleeps on Sundays and does not go to church, for example an episode included within the Fiery River in the church of St. George in Lazaropole.<sup>116</sup>

# Pseudo-icons

On both sides of the entrance to the nave are the five so-called pseudo-icons painted above the base with flower vases (ill. 12). To the south of the door

<sup>113</sup> Garidis M.K, *Etudes sur le Jugement dernier*, 91-114; Betea R., *Păcătoși și pedepse eterne. Iconografia Iadului în bisericile de lemn din comitatul Maramureş*, Memoria Ethnologica 46-47 (2013), 91.

<sup>115</sup> Василиев А., Ерминии. Технология и иконография, 121-122. is the half-length figure of Jesus Christ Pantocrator  $(IC XC ECE \Delta F \times HTE \Lambda L)$ , dressed in a cinnabar chiton and a blue-green himation. Christ makes the gesture of blessing with his right hand and in his left hand holds an open book with the inscription: AZL @CML СВЪТЪ МНРУ ХОДАН ПОМНІЪ НЕ НМАТЪ ХОДЕТН ВО TMT NO HMATT (BTTTMHEOTHLH (John 8:12). Next to him is the half-length winged figure of St. John the Forerunner (CTLIH IQANNL IFATEYL), who also makes the gesture of blessing with his right hand, while in his left hand holds his severed head and a scroll with a damaged inscription: [Π]OKA[H]TE[CA]...<sup>117</sup> Further on is St. Demetrios conquering the beast (CTLIH AHMHTPIH NOGTAH ZETPA), shown as a fulllength figure dressed in a long white shirt and a red tunic, decorated with floral motifs, as well as blue chlamys. Depicted with a martyr's wreath on his head, the saint holds a cross with his right hand, and a spear with his left hand, while stamping upon a scorpion. The scorpion, as a symbol of Satan, in the scenes from the hagiographical cycle of this saint, appears in most of the Athonite wall-paintings from 18<sup>th</sup> century, but this characteristic detail is usually present in the depictions of St. Demetrios enthroned and in the scene of the saint in prison.<sup>118</sup> The fulllength figure of St. Demetrios as a warrior saint and a cross in his hand, with the scorpion being crushed under his feet, is previously represented in the Refectory of the Monastery of St. John Forerunner at Bigor (c. 1833), attributed to the painter Mihail from Samarina and his son Dimitar/Daniil.<sup>119</sup>

To the north of the door the *Holy Mother of God* with Christ is depicted. The Mother of God (MHP  $\Theta$ Y) dressed in red maphorion, with her right hand points toward the little Christ ( $\overline{IC} \ \overline{XC}$ ) wearing a white chiton with floral decoration and a red himation. He makes the gesture of blessing with his right hand, and in his left hand holds an open book with the text:  $A\overline{XL} \ \Gamma \overline{CAHL}$  NAMH  $L \in \Gamma O \ \overline{AC} \ \Gamma AAH \ \Pi OMAZAMA \ \overline{LA} \Gamma OSL$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> Garidis M.K, Les punitions collectives et individuelles des dannés dans le Jugement dernier (du XII<sup>e</sup> au XIV<sup>e</sup> siècle, ZLU 18 (1982), 1-17; Ibid., Etudes sur le Jugement dernier, 86-91; Тодић Б., Новооткриене представе грешника на Страшном суду у Грачаници, ЗЛУ 14 (1978), 193-207; Ibid., Грачаница. Сликарство, Београд-Приштина 1988, 163.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> Betea R., Păcătoși și pedepse eterne, 92.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> The inscription from the episode in Lazaropole has been identified, but the scene has remained unrecognized, see Тричковска J.,*Страшниот суд во цр. Св. Ѓорѓи*, 230. According to the inscription and the iconography, it is clear that this particular sin was depicted (from personal notes).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>117</sup> The rest of the text has not been preserved, but probably a quote from the Gospel of Matthew 3:2; 4:17 was written. The quotation, which is often included in the representations of St. John the Forerunner, is also present on other Dicho Zograf's works/icons, see Грозданов Ц., *Дичо Зограф и неговите ученици*, ill. 3-4; Цветковски С., *Иконите на Дичо Зограф*, 33, 37, 42, ill. 3 (St. Achillius – Trebishte), ill. 10 (the Monastery of Rajchica), ill. 14 (the church of Holy Mother of God - Rostushe).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup> Kyriakoudis E.N., *The scene of the martyrdom of Saint Demetrios in post-Byzantine art*, Zograf 31 (2006-2007, 210 (with examples and bibliography).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>119</sup> Тричковска Ј., "*Тематиката на живописот на машката трпезарија во манастирот Св. Јован Би*горски", in: Група автори, Манастир Свети Јован Бигорски, Скопје 1994, 157-158, ill. 15; Eadem, *Делата во Македонија на сликарското семејство*, 259, T.VIII.

CTHTH NHIULIM'S **IOCAMMA** (Luke 4:18). Right next to them is one of the most popular representations of *St. George slaying the Dragon* (CTLIH  $\Gamma \in OPT^{TH}$ ). The patron of the church is depicted as a horseman piercing a dragon with a spear, thereby rescuing the princess shown at the gates of the castle.

Fresco-icons or the so-called pseudo-icons painted in different places of the churches are known from the Byzantine art,<sup>120</sup> and in addition to the medieval tradition their depiction continues in the post-Byzantine period.<sup>121</sup> In the post-Byzantine examples, their place is usually in the narthex by the entrance leading to the nave, or on façades, and very often in combination with the Last Judgement.<sup>122</sup> Although, not a permanent and obligatory part of the Last Judgement, their position and the prominent mediatrix role points to a specific expansion of the eschatological character of this composition.<sup>123</sup> At the same time, the two saints, George and Demetrios, are portrayed as conquerors of the beast, which can also be interpreted as a victory over the beast of the Last Judgement.

The impressive composition of the Last Judgement in the church of St. George in Banjani is also supplemented by the rich color palette consisting of various and intense colors, the most dominant of which is the red. Dicho Zograf skillfully and creatively managed to organize the surface, were he incorporated numerous figures, depictions and scenes, including the explanatory inscriptions. Certain inconsistencies are noticeable in the proportions of some of the figures, especially when depicting the hands and feet. At the same time, some of the figures are with much larger dimensions than the rest, which probably meant that the painter wanted to emphasize the importance of certain scenes.

\* \* \*

Dicho's Last Judgement in Banjani was created between the compilation of his two Hermeneias, but they do not contain all the scenes and motifs that he depicted. Besides the similarities and influences from the painter Mihail from Samarina and the Last Judgement in the church of St. George in Lazaropole, Dicho Zograf certainly had other sources of inspiration. According to our research, parts of the motifs are with Russian and Bulgarian provenance, and some are similar to elements of the Athonite paper icons circulating in this area during that time. Dicho Zograf created an impressive and unique eschatological composition enriched with numerous episodes, motifs, and especially inscriptions, allowing us to consider it as an important, not only visual or artistic, but also a literary heritage.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>120</sup> Ђорђевић И.М., *О фреско-иконама код Срба у* средњем веку, ЗЛУ 14 (978), 79, 91-92.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>121</sup> Пеич С., *Фреско-икони от поствизантийския период в Сърбия*, Изкуство 33-34 (1996), 45-49.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>122</sup> Пејић С., "*Црна Река – уз проблем живописа на фасадама*", in: Манастир Црна ријека и Свети Петар Коришки, Приштина-Београд 1998, 118-119.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>123</sup> More on their role and meaning, as well as depiction of the fresco-icons in combination with the Last Judgement from the church of St. George in Lazaropole: Тричковска J., *Страшниот суд во цр. Св. Ѓорѓи*, 235-236.

<sup>\*</sup> Origin of the illustrations: Jehona Spahiu Janchevska and Vladimir Janchevski. I would like to express my special gratitude to Gordana Ristova (Skopje), Darko Nikolovski (Skopje), Ljuben Domozetski (Sofia), and Vladimir Janchevski (Skopje) for their unselfish help in obtaining a part of the quoted bibliography in this article.

### Јехона СПАХИУ ЈАНЧЕВСКА

# СТРАШНИОТ СУД ВО ЦРКВАТА СВ. ЃОРЃИ ВО БАЊАНИ

### Резиме:

Црквата Св. Ѓорѓи во близина на скопското село Бањани е изградена и живописана во 1548/49 година. Во текот на XIX век изгледот на еднобродната црква со полуобличест свод бил изменет со отворањето на прозорците и со доградбата на припратата. Во ктиторскиот натпис над западната врата која води од припратата во наосот е одбележано дека обновата на црквата била заслуга на ктиторот Петар Каовче и жителите на селото. Во продолжение е наведено дека сликањето на храмот е дело на зографот Димитар Крстев(ич) - Дичо од казата Дебар, завршено во 1846 година. На целата површина од источниот ѕид на припратата, Дичо Зограф ја насликал впечатливата и комплексна композиција на Страшниот суд, со богата илустративност, наративност и извонредно чувство за детали, придружени со голем број објаснувачки текстови. Инаку, Страшниот суд од Бањани е досега единствениот познат пример на оваа композиција во творештвото на зографот.

На целата ѕидна површина е илустрацијата на Страшниот суд каде Деисисот и апостолскиот трибунал денес не се видливи од подоцна поставената рамна дрвена таваница. Под таваницата е Приготвениот престол со симболите на евангелисите, Адам и Ева, двете групи сиромави прикажани како благодарни праведни и просјаци-грешници, како и групата праведници. На северната половина од ѕидната површина е прикажан Рајот каде се вообичаените претстави на Богородица меѓу двајцата архангели, праотците Аврам, Исак и Јаков до кои има фигури на деца означени како девици и Праведниот разбојник. Во подножјето на рајските ѕидини од лачните отвори истекуваат четирите рајски реки Фисон, Геон, Еуфрат и Тигар. Под Приготвениот престол се наоѓа Мерењето на душите со праведното мерило, каде во овој случај Раката Божја ја држи терезијата, а меѓу тасовите е насликана персонификацијата на душата. Во близина се илустрирани елементи од Општиот воскрес каде два ангела во лет трубејќи кон земјата и морето ги повикуваат мртвите. Покрај персонификациите на Земјата и Морето, прикажани се и четирите ветрови Бореја, Еврос, Зефир и Нотос.

Огнената Река е една од најживописните и најкарактеристични решенија на Страшниот суд во Бањани. Насликана како црвена маса со пламени јазици и бранови, во неа има голем број грешници меѓу кои се убиците, маѓепсниците, Кајафа, Константин Копроним, Ахав и Јеровоам, а потоа грешни архимандрити, јереи, архијереи и ѓакони, додека ѓаволи ги врзуваат во синџири и ги туркаат со гребла. Огнената Река завршува во ширум отворената адска челуст каде стои Сатаната со Јуда, гребло, пламена чаша и синџири во рацете, а од устата му излегува обратно испишан текст. Од адското ждрело излегува долг јазик што завршува со змиска глава, а на врвот е наведено Митарство. Руската варијанта на Митарствата во нашите примери ќе биде воведена од Дичо Зограф токму во бањанскиот Страшен суд.

Во продолжение на композицијата е прикажан Мојсеј како предводник на групата Евреи, како и Четирите царства со четирите животни. Меѓу четирите пагански цареви произлезени од Визијата на пророкот Даниил каде тие се симбол на четирите империи на старите народи кои пропаднале со доаѓањето на Христос и кои го претставуваат Вавилонското, Персиското, Римското и Македонското царство, е прикажан и Александар Велики. Во рамките на Страшниот суд се наоѓаат три сцени поврзани со пророкот Илија, праведниот Енох и Антихристот кои припаѓаат на т.н. апокалиптични мотиви инспирирани од Откровението и за првпат воведени во нашите примери од Дичо Зограф.

Страшниот суд во Бањани е дополнет со композицијата Тркало на животот која припаѓа на темите со морализаторско-дидактички карактер и во која се рефлектира средновековната идеја за минливоста на земниот живот и сфаќањето на времето како незапирлив круг. Композицијата на Страшниот суд е заокружена со илустрирање на скратената верзија на Спасителното исповедување, како и приказ на различни категории и индивидуални маки на грешници. Од двете страни на влезот во наосот, пак, има имитација на иконостас со вази со цвеќиња во цоклето и пет псевдо/ѕидни икони на Исус Христос Седржител, Богородица со Христос, св. Јован Претеча, св. Димитриј го победи ѕверот и патронот св. Горѓи како ја убива ламјата. Нивната местоположба и нагласената застапничка улога укажува на специфично проширување на есхатолошкиот карактер на композицијата на Страшниот суд.

Покрај долгото и исклучително плодно творештво, познато е дека Дичо Зограф бил составувач и на два сликарски прирачници, Првата Ерминија (пред 1844 г.) и Втората Ерминија (1851 г.), коишто претставуваат компилација од различни извори, сликарски прирачници и книжни икони, а во нив се содржани и описи на Страшниот суд. Иако сликањето на бањанската припрата е меѓу составувањето на двете ерминии, сепак во нив не се содржани сите претстави, сцени и мотиви кои тој ги насликал. Покрај очигледните блискости и влијанија од зографот Михаил од Самарина и особено Страшниот суд во црквата Св. Ѓорѓи во Лазарополе (1836), Дичо Зограф очигледно имал и други извори на инспирација. Според нашите истражувања, голем дел од мотивите се со руска и бугарска провениенција, а некои се слични со елементи од светогорските книжни икони коишто во тој период циркулирале на ова подрачје. Дичо Зограф создал впечатлива и уникатна есхатолошка композиција збогатена со голем број епизоди, мотиви и особено натписи, што може да се смета не само како значаен и исклучителен ликовен ансамбл туку и како богато литературно наследство.