

Robert MIHAJLOVSKI

## THE SIXTEENTH CENTURY MOSQUES OF BITOLA / TOLI MANASTIR<sup>1</sup>



Fig. 1. Panorama of the city of Manastir, painted by Edward Lear in 1848. On the right side is the Kızlar Bey turbe, in the centre is the mosque of Haydar Kadi with its original minaret, to the left are the mosques of Sungur Bey and Ishakkiye, further to the left is the Sahat Kule (Clock tower) and the Yeni mosque.

The town of Manastir is a large city situated on the lower slopes of a mountain, on the left and on the right sides of the river, which are connected by ten wooden or stone bridges. The town is full of greenery, adorned with a thousand huge trees from which it is hard to see it, until you reach it. The town is divided into twenty-one districts (mahalle) and its houses are built out of solid material and covered by tiles.

The mosques. There were 70 Muslim places of worship (Mihrab). The most remarkable is the mosque of Ishak Çelebi near the Big Bridge... There is another mosque of Mahmud efendi with an inscription...

The Gazi Haydar mosque is an artistically splendid built place for worship. The mosque of Hacı Bey is located on the Turners (Çekrekçi) market. The Çavuş mosque that is close to the Bedesten has plenty of worshippers. The town has nine religious colleges (Medrese). The most impressive is the Dulbend Kadı medrese.<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> I am indebted to my colleague and friend Mudžait Asimov for his help and comments..

<sup>2</sup> Evlija Čelebija, *Putopis II*, Sarajevo, 1957, 57-59; I. Emin, *Evljija Čelebi za Makedonija, izbor, adaptacija, prevod od turski i predgovor*, Skopje 2007, 24-25. Toli Manastir had the status of *şehir*, which was equal to a large town or a city. Çelebi's description of the city and its places of worship is supported by various authors such as: M. Tevfik, 'Kratka istorija bitoljskog vilajeta', *Brastvo*, vol. XXVII, (transl. G. Elezović) (1933) 211-124; J. Hadži Vasiljević, 'Grad Bitolj', *Kroz staru Srbiju i Makedoniju 1897 godine*, *Brastvo* vol. XIV, (1911) 41; E.H. Ayverdi, *Asimpada Osmanli mimari eserleri Jugoslaviya*, vol. III, Istanbul 1981, 95-107; K. Tomovski, 'Džamii vo Bitola', *Godišen Zbornik na Tehničkiot fakultet*, (1956/57) 36-38, 48-49; H. Kaleši, *Najstariji vakufski dokumenti u Jugoslaviji na arapskom jeziku*, Priština 1972, 65-69; A. Andrejević, *Islamska monumentalna umetnost XVI veka u Jugoslaviji*, Beograd 1984, 24-26; M. Sokolowski, 'Turski izvorni podatoci od XV i XVI vek za gradot Bitola', *Glasnik na institutot za nacionalna istorija*, vol. VII/1,

In the year 1661 the famous Ottoman traveler Evliya Çelebi, the author of the book *Seyahâtnâme* (Book of Travels), visited the town of Toli Manastır. His description of Bitola/Manastır is one of the most valuable documents concerning the Ottoman character and profile of the city. (Fig. 1. *Panorama of the city painted in 1848 by E. Lear*)

Among the seven main mosques built in Bitola/Manastır in the period between the years 1400 and 1650 at least six were erected in the 16<sup>th</sup> century. The most widespread plan in this period was the standard-style unit mosque with a portico covered by three small domes and one minaret on the right side of the prayer hall. The most intensive development of Ottoman architecture in Bitola was in the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> centuries, with the erection of religious buildings of a monumental nature. The concepts and architectural style and ornament of the mosque buildings carried the stamp of the Ottoman capitals: Bursa, with its Selcuk traditions, then the second capital city of Edirne and the later Istanbul, as centers of Early and Classical Ottoman architectural styles. In Manastır the earliest mosque was that of Sungur Çavuş Bey built in 1435, an example in the Selcuk/Bursa style.<sup>3</sup> Also, the mosque of Hacı Mahmud Bey erected in 1521 and the Hasan Baba mosque, built between 1628 and 1640, were the remnants of Bursa's traditionalism in the area. But the largest and most monumental of the city's mosques were the Ishak Çelebi Cami of 1506, the Kadi Mahmud efendi or Yeni Cami of 1553 and the Gazi Haydar Kadi Cami erected in 1565. They expressed the architectural tendencies of

---

(1963) 129, 148. There are seventy main mosques and small places of worship-mescids, connected with Çelebi's descriptions, which certainly exaggerated the number. They were: Sungur Çavuş Bey or Eski cami, Isa Fakih or Çinar Mufti cami, Ishak Çelebi cami, Hacı Mahmud Bey cami, Koca Kadi cami, Kadi Mahmud Efendi or Yeni cami, Gazi Haydar Kadi cami, Hasan Baba cami, Hamza Bey or Üç Şeyhler cami, Egrikaş Efendi or Ayşe Hatun cami, Kırık or Yıkık cami (Broken mosque), Paftalı cami, Zandancık or Derviş cami, Şehzade Hatun cami, Yakub cami, Sapuncu cami, Hacı Kethuda mescid, Ahmed Efendi mescid, Mahmud Aga mescid, Şeyh Hızır Bali mescid, Küçük Sinan mescid, Nasuh Bey mescid, Hacı Atmaca mescid, Abdi Bey mescid and so on.

<sup>3</sup> R. Mihajlovski, 'Nekolku osmanliski spomenici od Bitola,' *Kulturno nasledstvo*, vol. 26-27, Skopje 2001, 67; H. W. Lowry, *The shaping of the Ottoman Balkans 1350-1550, the conquest, settlement and infrastructural development*, Istanbul 2008, 128-129; H.Z. Watenpugh, *The image of an Ottoman city, Imperial architecture and urban experience in Aleppo in the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> centuries*, Leiden, Boston 2004, 50-86; L.Thys-Senocak, *Ottoman women builders, The architectural patronage of Hadice Turhan Sultan*, Aldershot 2006, 187-256.

the transitional phases of Early Ottoman style from Edirne, with strong influences of the Classical Ottoman style, inspired by the schools of the Court architects, Hayreddin and Mimar Sinan.<sup>4</sup> The buildings in Manastır represent a simplified form of the Imperial mosques of the Ottoman school, with some local constructive characteristics. The plan was usually a base square, topped by either a dome or a wooden roof construction. Wooden roofs covered the smaller mosques in the town, such as the Isa Fekih of 1506 and Koca Kadı of 1529. The main mosques with their educational and religious buildings were erected and supported by the pious endowments of local judges or the highest officials. Bitola's mosques and their complexes were built on the same urban and architectural pattern followed throughout the Ottoman Empire. In the front there was usually a fountain (Şadırvan) for Abdest. A small cemetery (Mezarlık) surrounded the building, reminding rich and poor believers about the after-life. A three-domed open portico (Son cemaat yeri) covered the entrance for late worshippers. In Bitola a double portico with six domes for the latecomers in prayer was an exceptional case at the mosques of Ishak Çelebi and Yeni; this may have been influenced by Byzantine monastic architecture. In the portico a richly decorated portal marked the entrance to the prayer hall. The Haydar kadi mosque had an elaborate stucco portal with an inscription plaque; the Yeni mosque had a portal decorated with blue glazed Iznik tiles, a wooden balcony and a glazed inscription plaque.<sup>5</sup> The main prayer hall was usually a square covered by a dome, which was connected to the walls by means of squinches. Pendentives were to be found in the earliest and simplest mosque buildings, such as the Sungur Çavuş Bey mosque, the Paftalı mosque, the Broken mosque and the Kızlar Bey Türbe.<sup>6</sup> At the mosque of Üç Şeyhler or Hamza Bey from the 17<sup>th</sup> century a rectangular apse covered the Mihrab niche, separating the prayer hall from the Qible wall.

---

<sup>4</sup> G. Necipoğlu, *The Age of Sinan, architectural culture in the Ottoman Empire*, London 2005, 157-158. In the 16<sup>th</sup> century the institution of provincial city architects was established. An imperial decree addressed to the kadi of Skopje in 1568 reveals that the chief architect (mimarbası) of the provincial capital was Hayrüddin, whose assistants included Üstad Memi and Yusuf. The chief architect of Skopje was in charge of recruiting masons and artisans for Sinan's major building, same of them against their will.

<sup>5</sup> Tomovski, op. cit., 34-40; R. Mihajlovski, 'The Yeni mosque in Bitola in the light of the most recent archaeological information', *Patrimonium.MK* 3-4, 5-6, (2008-2009), 183-188.

<sup>6</sup> R. Mihajlovski, 'Nekolku osmanliski spomenici od Bitola,' *Kulturno nasledstvo*, vol. 26-27, Skopje 2001, 69-70; L. Kumbaradži-Bogojević, *Osmanliski spomenici vo Skopje*, Skopje 1998.



Fig. 2, Isa Fakih mosque, situations in 2001 and in 1943

Such an unusual use of the apse is a probable result of mutual influences of Byzantine and Ottoman architecture, which had its beginnings in the 14<sup>th</sup> century. Some of the poorer quarters' mosques had rectangular bases and were covered by a hipped roof and terracotta tiles, for example, the Koca Kadi cami of 1529. Above the main entrance the wooden balcony (Mahvill mükebbire) was constructed, serving as a platform for the muezzin's service, or later for distinguish ladies. Opposite, on the Qible wall, towards Mecca, was the niche, or Mihrab, decorated with geometric stalactites. The mosques of Ishakkye, Yeni and Haydar Kadi had richly elaborated Mihrab ornamentation. On the right side of the prayer hall was a Minber, a wooden dais reached by a tall staircase and decorated with geometrical motifs. On the left, next to the wall was the Qursu, a high chair for the local imam when teaching. The Ishak Çelebi mosque had a circular gallery inside the drum of the dome locally called 'Donanma' used for maintenance purposes; this is a unique case among Bitola's mosques.<sup>7</sup> On the right of the prayer hall was the spot where the solidly built minaret with a decorated balcony was located. The Selcuk decorated minaret of the Sungur Çavuş mosque was an exception, for it was on the left side of the prayer hall, mounted on the wall. The two bases for minarets, which rose on either side of

the Haydar Kadi Cami prayer hall, were also unusual. Besides this, the mosque had only a single minaret tower that was razed during the First World War.<sup>8</sup> The basic building materials were stone and brick, applied in the ancient Byzantine technique of picturesque alternation of layers of brick and stone, or by inserting bricks between cut stone in the Cloisonné manner. There were also colored inner wall decorations, mainly floral or geometric in character, sometimes completed with the Holy names and verses from the Koran or with simple landscapes from the Holy Land, Hecaz or Istanbul.<sup>9</sup> The monumental mosques were evenly spread through the city, especially on the left side of the river Dragor, where the main administrative and commercial area was designated. There follows a more detailed discussion of each of them, and some other Islamic buildings. This forms a kind of extended catalogue of the Muslim religious edifices in Bitola.

**The Isa Fakih or Çınar Mufti Cami.** The mosque of Isa Fakih is located on the left side of the river Dragor, in one of the oldest quarters, on the Mufti Place (Mufti Meidanlık), close to the Big Çınar

<sup>7</sup> R. Momidić, 'Džamijata Ishak-Çelebi vo Bitola', *Zbornik na trudovi, Zavod za zaštita na spomenicite na kulturata, muzej i galerija, Bitola* vol. I (1979) 64; Andrejević, op. cit., 26.

<sup>8</sup> Tomovski, op. cit., 52; Andrejević, op. cit., 36.

<sup>9</sup> A. Kuran, *The Mosque in Early Ottoman architecture*, Chicago and London 1968, 15-27; B. Unsal, *Turkish Islamic Architecture, in Seldjuk and Ottoman times 1071-1932*, London 1959; Tomovski, op. cit., 1956/57, 34-45; Andrejevic, op. cit., 46-101; H. Redzic, *Islamska umjetnost*, Beograd, Zagreb, Mostar 1982, 54-108.



Fig. 3, Ishak Celebi mosque in 1918 and in 2000

tree, and the Eski Çifte hammam. It was erected in 911 AH/1505-1506, and it was renovated 1259 AH/1843.<sup>10</sup> Isa Fakih was a well-known judge of Bitola and father of another famous judge, Ishak Çelebi ibn Isa. His name Fakih denotes that he was one of the jurists lecturing in Law (Fıkıh) at the School of the Jurisprudence in Manastır. It seems that for some time he was a Defterdar (a head of the Finance department of a Vilayet) at the Sultan's palace. In one of the documents connected with the town of Çirmen it was mentioned: 'Timar-i Mevlana Isa Fakih, defterdarı Padişah', (The timar of our molla Fakih, the defterdar of the Sultan).<sup>11</sup> (Fig. 2, Isa Fakih mosque, situations in 2001 and in 1943)

In the year of Hicra 911 or 1505 AD he built a mosque on Mufti Square. It seems that he also held a position as Mufti in the town's administration. For the maintenance of the mosque he organized a religious foundation, a pious Vakıf comprising twelve shops, fifteen houses and the whole tax collection from the Wheat market. It was known that he built a mescid in the Isa Fakih district in Edirne and one unknown inn (han).<sup>12</sup> On the minaret base, a one-line inscription on a marble plaque states that the mosque was renovated in 1259 AH/1843. The inscription reads as follows: 'What God wishes. Year 1259.'<sup>13</sup> The modest mosque

building comprises the main prayer hall of 10.25 x 8.55 meters, with a minaret on the west side and a Revak (porch) added later on the northern side. The prayer hall is a simple rectangular building covered by a hipped roof and terracotta tiles. Originally, under the roof, the ceiling had a dome constructed out of wood. A simple porch five meters long was added later, with a wall thickness of 0.85 m. The mihrab was turned 43 degrees towards Mecca and it was cut out in marble. Five rows of stalactite Mukarnas decorated the Qible wall. Decorations were made around the rectangular windows and on the wall niche, Kirsuri, set aside for preaching. The minaret is set in the middle of the western wall; its base is made out of cut stone, with an upper shaft built of bricks and plastered, pointing to the transformations made over the centuries. Locally, the mosque had a popular name Çınar Mufti Cami, or later it was known as Salih Cami. These days the mosque building is in use as an automechanic workshop and it is neglected.<sup>14</sup>

**The Kadi Ishak Çelebi Cami or Ishakkiye.** Ishak Çelebi mosque, the largest main mosque (Ulucami) in Bitola, is a notable monument, situated along the north bank of the Dragor River.<sup>15</sup> This area was known as Bit pazar in the quarter of Emir Bey or Eyne Bey, also known as Ishak Çelebi mahalle. The whole mosque complex was ideally situated between

<sup>10</sup> Kaleşi, op. cit., 146-148; Tevfik, op. cit., 211-212; Ayverdi, op. cit., 99-100. The name Çınar Mufti is in the Land registered catalogue number 4911.

<sup>11</sup> Kaleşi, op. cit., 145-146.

<sup>12</sup> Idem, 145-146; Tevfik, op. cit., 211; Ayverdi, op. cit., 99; Kaleşi, op. cit., 145; Cohen, op. cit., 117. Isa Fekih owned one spring fountain in the town of Manastır, and another one in Hlerin/Florina, close to the Old mosque 'Cami Atiq' in the quarter 'Dert yöl azı' (Old fountain).

<sup>13</sup> Idem, 145-146; Tevfik, op. cit., 211; Ayverdi, op. cit., 99; Kaleşi, op. cit., 145; M. Cohen, 'Villes macédoniennes. Florina-Nevoļjani', *La Géographie*, 34, Paris 1920, 117. Isa Fekih owned one spring fountain in the town of

Manastır, and another one in Hlerin/Florina, close to the Old mosque 'Cami Atiq' in the quarter 'Dert yöl azı' (Old fountain).

<sup>14</sup> Tomovski, op. cit., 57; Ayverdi, op. cit., 99-100; Asimov, op. cit., 35.

<sup>15</sup> Tevfik, op. cit., 211; Hadzi Vasiljević, op. cit., 19; Cepenkov, op. cit., 222. In the local legends, the mosque of Hazreti Isa was built on the place where the church of the Holy Resurrection once stood. Cepenkov wrote that it was the church of the Holy Spirit, but no archaeological evidence exists.



Fig. 4, Ishak Celebi mosque, etching by H. Catenacci

the government buildings and the covered market, and the Big Bridge to the other side of the river connected it.<sup>16</sup> (Fig. 3, Ishak Celebi mosque in 1918 and in 2000), (Fig. 4, Ishak Celebi mosque, etching by H. Catenacci)

Popularly known as Ishakkiye, this monumental mosque was named after its founder, Judge Ishak Çelebi ibn Isa, son of Isa Fakih. After being a judge in Salonica for many years, Ishak Çelebi was appointed to the Kadi's bench in Manastir where he moved with his family around 914 AH/1508.<sup>17</sup> The foundation inscription, which is set above the main inner portal, informs the visitor that the mosque was erected in 912 AH/1506. The marble plaque measures 150 by 70 cm and the inscription is written in eight verses divided in eight equal fields. The date is given as a chronogram and is written in Nesih:

*Help (is coming) in the name of Allah, the Merciful,  
the Compassionate  
the old house was beautified by the chronogram  
His noble Ishak ibn Isa, may his happiness last,*

<sup>16</sup> In 1848 the town of Manastir was visited by Edward Lear who painted a few watercolors inspired by the Ishak Çelebi mosque and its environment. See: *Edward Lear in the Levant: Travels in Albania, Greece and Turkey in Europe*, (ed. S.Hyman), London 1988, 79.

<sup>17</sup> Kaleši, op cit., 114; Tevfik, op. cit., 39; An excellent study was written by R. Momidić, 'Džamijata Ishak-Çelebi vo Bitola', *Zbornik na trudovi, Zavod za zaštita na spomenicite na kulturata, muzej i galerija, Bitola* vol. I (1979) 47; Andrejević, *Islamska monumentalna umetnost XVI veka u Jugoslaviji*, Beograd 1984, 25; K. Balabanov, A. Nikolovski, D. Čornakov, *Spomenici na kulturata na Makedonija*, (ed. B. Pavlovski), Skopje 1980, 197. M.

*May His honor increase in Paradise  
He built the mosque, fortunately for us.  
By that he acquired the Omniscient's mercy.  
Afterwards, inspired, he dictated a chronogram:  
He arrived in the name of Allah, the Merciful, the  
Compassionate*<sup>18</sup>

The date of the mosque construction was given in the last verse of the chronogram (Ebcad) and it is 912 AH/1506. According to the recent research done by Mudžaid Asimov, the last verse (Tarih) or chronogram in which the date of the construction of Ishakkiye is given, of which every letter has a fixed value, was wrongly calculated by Evliya Çelebi, Ayverdi and Kaleši. He re-read the chronogram and the sum of these values gives the proper date, which is 912 after Hicra or 24 May 1506.<sup>19</sup> For his religious establishment Ishak Çelebi made a pious endowment charter—a Vakıfname, on June 22-31, 1508. From the second Vakıfname, ratified on July 10-19, in the same year, it is clear that Ishak Çelebi's charitable foundation consisted of one mosque, one mekteb, one medrese, 105 shops, four rooms, one zaviye, twenty mills, one piece of land, a collection of books for the medrese and the sum of 300,000 golden dirhems. For the zaviye building he granted another sum of 20,000 and 2,000 dirhems for the mekteb. And for the

Kiel, *Studies on the Ottoman Architecture of the Balkans*, Aldershot, Brookfield 1990, I/141.

<sup>18</sup> Kaleši, op. cit., 146-147; Andrejević, op. cit., 25. I am very grateful to my colleague M. Asimov for his translation.

<sup>19</sup> Çelebi, op. cit., 282; Kaleši, op. cit., 146-147; Ayverdi, op. cit., 101; Asimov, op. cit., 2001, 36-37. The chronogram reading was done by Evliya Çelebi in 1661, H. Kaleši

maintenance of such a large religious and educational complex, Kadi Ishak Çelebi defined a sum of 10,000 dirhems per annum, which included: eight dirhems per day for the Mütevelli, four dirhems for the Nazir, twenty dirhems per day for the medrese's muderis and ten dirhems daily allowance for each of the students. Besides, there was provision for a number of staff such as: the Imam and the Hatib, who were paid four dirhems per day; the chief Hafiz was paid two dirhems, another three hafizes were paid one dirhem each per day and the door-keeper and sweeper half a dirhem each per day. In the last part of his Vakıfname, signed before the judge of Manastır, Ali Abdul Rahman, Ishak Çelebi made the last conditions that after his death, his eldest son Molla Mustafa Çelebi should carry the guardianship and his second son Molla Seyid Ahmed should be supervisor, and after them, their sons...<sup>20</sup> There is a local legend about the disappointment of the future architect visiting the swampy terrain where the mosque was to be built. But, when Ishak Çelebi threw a bag of gold coins in front of him, he realized his strong determination and started work immediately.<sup>21</sup> The turquoise star of Solomon that is inlaid on the south façade is a mark of the architect. The whole mosque complex consisted of one monumental Friday mosque, a medrese with ten rooms, two guesthouses (musafirhane), a printing workshop, an imaret and kitchen, a horse stable and public toilets, the zaviye and mekteb with a library of 275 volumes and three Korans. Due to maladministration by the trustees over the centuries the whole property vanished, except for the mosque building, which is very well preserved.<sup>22</sup> The kadi Ishak Çelebi ibn Isa died on 1 August 1512 in Bitola/Manastır, leaving large vakıf endowments in Salonica, Plovdiv, Tatar Pazarcik and Bitola. He was buried next to the minaret of his favored Hazreti Ishak mosque with an epitaph on the tombstone: "Allah is everlasting. The death of blessed deceased Ishak Çelebi, son of Isa (it has happened) on 18 gumad al-awalla 918 (1512)."<sup>23</sup> Evliya Çelebi visited the Ishakkiye mosque in 1661 and

claimed it was the best among all Bitola's mosques.<sup>24</sup> At the end of the 18<sup>th</sup> century and the beginnings of the 19<sup>th</sup> century, lightning struck the minaret damaging the portico and a local Christian mason – Majstor Gine, from Smilevo village, repaired it. The portico was enlarged as a closed double gallery with another row of three domes and covered by a sloping roof, which was an unusual constructive element, a feature rarely to be found in this type of architecture. It has its parallels in the 19<sup>th</sup> century monastic churches of Mount Athos. According to J.A. Hamilton: 'Churches of Athos are distinguished also by the largeness of the narthex, which usually has six bays in two rows. Certain monastic offices were recited in the narthex and the larger space than usual was required for the monks who were to participate in these services. In later days nartheces were built in two divisions, the outer of which was called the Liti.'<sup>25</sup>

The portico enlargement was done in the 19<sup>th</sup> century due to the rapid development of the town as a military and administrative centre. In 1905 the Sultan Mehmed V Reşad paid an official visit to the major mosque in the town. For that event a Royal wooden balcony (Hünkâr mahvili) was constructed in the prayer hall, the wall decoration was repainted, calligraphic inscriptions with the holy verses adorned the walls, and a few expensive Oriental rugs were donated.<sup>26</sup> These days the Ishak Çelebi mosque is a well-preserved monument, which is the major place of worship for the local Muslim community. The dome of the auditorium measures externally not more than 14.52 m. in diameter and 26 m. in height.<sup>27</sup> The monumental dimensions, harmonious proportions and simplicity are intended to enhance the structural dominance of the mosque. The octagonal drum, decorated by windows on each side, is mounted on the building by means of stalactite squinches. The inside of the drum has a circular gallery popularly known as 'Donanma'; it was constructed for practical purposes and it is a unique case in Bitola's area.<sup>28</sup> The pitched-roofed triangular projections cover the

in 1972, E.H., Ayverdi in 1981 and by M. Asimov in 1999, who re-calculated the numerical values convincingly.

<sup>20</sup> Kaleši, op. cit., 186-201; Ayverdi, op. cit., 101; Momidić, op. cit., 1979, 48-49.

<sup>21</sup> Kaleši, op. cit., 145-146.

<sup>22</sup> Tefvik, op. cit., 211; Ayverdi, op. cit., 102.

<sup>23</sup> The Assertion of Andrejević, op. cit., 25; Momidić, op. cit., 1979, 47; Redzić, op. cit., 89, about the grave monument which is located in front of the mosque is not accurate. According to M. Asimov, the Ottoman Baroque grave monument which is standing on the southern side of the mosque is not the genuine grave of kadi Ishak Çelebi. It is a much later one, dedicated to Reşid Paşa the Rumeli Muşir, who died in 1262 AH/1846. A half century ago the

Ishakkiye mosque had a large cemetery, mainly with the graves of the ruling Ottoman class, consisting of richly elaborated marble monuments. See: Tomovski, op. cit., 48-49; Asimov, op. cit., 2001, 36.

<sup>24</sup> Çelebija, op. cit., 57.

<sup>25</sup> J. A. Hamilton, *Byzantine Architecture and decoration*, London 1956, 209-210; M. Kiel, *Studies on the Ottoman Architecture of the Balkans*, Aldershot, Brookfield 1990, I/141.

<sup>26</sup> Tomovski, op. cit., 38, 48.

<sup>27</sup> Momidić, op. cit., 1979, 64; Andrejević op. cit., 26.

<sup>28</sup> 'Donanma' means illumination or decoration. A similar 'Donanma' gallery, which is on the inside of the drum, can be found at the church of St Sophia in Salonica



Fig. 5, Hacı Bey mosque in 2000

space between the drum and the squinch tops, a construction element used again in the Yeni mosque of 1558-59, and the mosque of Haydar Kadı of 1561-62. The basic building material is the ancient Byzantine technique of picturesque alternation of three layers of bricks and cut stone as well as inserting brick between cut stone in the “Cloisonné” manner. The wall thickness is between 1.65–2.10 m. on the Qible wall. The base of the prayer hall is a square with dimensions 14.55 x 14.55 m. and the wall thickness of 1.63-1.83m.<sup>29</sup> The interior is illuminated by three rows of windows of which the lowest ones are monumentally framed by marble, and have massive grilles and casement shutters. The fragments of red and green stained glass in stucco frames are remnants of the past glory of the building.<sup>30</sup> The mosque has a double portico made up of an atypical shed roof lean to the prayer hall, covering the two rows of six domed arcades, dividing the space into ten bays. An archaic decoration of the capitals with ‘Turkish triangles’ indicates that this portico once opened in three domed arcades. For

<sup>29</sup> Momidić, op. cit., 1979, 64; Andrejević, op. cit., 26.

<sup>30</sup> Ayverdi, op. cit., 101.

the latecomers this portico has two stalactite niches (Mukarnas) on the Qible wall. On the northwest side a polygonal stone minaret 45 m. high was erected.<sup>31</sup> The minaret base is square, built of a combination of ashlar and brick. The fourteen-sided shaft is built out of worked stone; it has stalactite decoration and a balcony with a marble parapet. The upper part of the minaret is a pointed cap covered by sheet lead. The interior space gives a sense of volume and grandeur, illuminated by a number of windows and richly decorated. The mihrab niche is tall, made out of white marble with six rows of stalactites Mihrab yaşmağı. The traditional furniture of the mosque is elegant and as finely worked as it could be in the 16<sup>th</sup> century. There are carved geometrical-patterns on most of the mosque architecture including the polygonal marble qursu and minbar, that has the reputation of being the finest in town. Also, there are casement shutters with woodcarved panels of inscriptions from the Koran, a Kelime-i Tavhid with the first verse from the Surah ‘Al Fatihah’: ‘All praise is due to God alone, the Sustainer of all the worlds.’<sup>32</sup> An unknown Italian or French artist repainted the murals of floral ornaments and landscapes around 1912 and they are of average quality.<sup>33</sup> The Ishak Çelebi mosque, also known as Hazret Ishak Camisi is reminiscent of the Edirne offshoot mosque architecture: starting with some elements from the Kasim Paşa mosque of 1478, in transition to a later mosque of Sultan Bayezit II, built in 1484-88, and designed by the court architect Mimar Hayreddin.<sup>34</sup> The monumental architecture in worked stone and above all the cubic plastic effects of the mosque distinguish it from the Bursa school, entering into the transitional patterns of the Early Classical style. The mosque of Ishak Çelebi with its architectural refinement reached the threshold of the Classical Ottoman style.

**The Hacı Mahmud Bey Cami or Hacı Bey Cami.** Surrounded by shops and old parts of the complex, close to the river Dragor, the Hacı Mahmud Bey mosque still occupies the best area of today’s market (the Fish market). In the times of Evliya Çelebi this part of the market belonged to the Turners (Çekrekçi) and to the Tailors, in the vicinity of the Horse market (At-pazar).<sup>35</sup> The mosque was built in the year of Hicra 928 or 1521-22 and it was renovated in 1873. The medrese that was a part of the complex was registered in the Land Survey register of 1074 AH/

<sup>31</sup> Tomovski, op. cit., 48; Andrejević, op. cit., 26.

<sup>32</sup> Ayverdi, op. cit., 102.

<sup>33</sup> Momidić, op. cit., 1979, 66.

<sup>34</sup> Kuran, op. cit., 44, 56-59; Momidić, op. cit., 1979, 66.

<sup>35</sup> Čelebija, op. cit., 58.



Fig. 6. Koca Kadi mosque in 2000

1663. The mosque was also noted in the Land Survey register dating from 1141 AH/ 1728.<sup>36</sup> The founder of the mosque and its complex was Hacı Mahmud Bey, known in the town as ‘Tomruk Aga’ (The prison warder). He may have been one of the war heroes (Gazi) of Sultan Bayezit Han and for that reason he was appointed as governor of the town, which he ruled in a despotic manner. In the oldest parts of the Çarşı (market), next to the river, he erected his pious mosque with its complex. For the maintenance of the complex he endowed a generous Vakıf of 300,000 bags of aspres (each bag contained 500 aspres), ten shops and ten houses.<sup>37</sup> In this vakıf were included the revenues from the two neighboring villages of Bukovo and Orehovo, then nine shops and two hamams in Berat and Iskenderiye in today’s Albania.<sup>38</sup> (Fig. 5, Hacı Bey mosque in 2000)

<sup>36</sup> Tefvik, op. cit., 213; Ayverdi, op. cit., 96. Following the oldest town registers the mosque of Hacı Bey, together with the mosques of Sungur Çavuş Bey and Ishakkiye were the oldest religious and educational centers of Islamic culture in the town. See: Sokoloski, op. cit., 1957, 39.

<sup>37</sup> Tefvik, op. cit., 213.

<sup>38</sup> R. Momidić-Petkova, ‘Kompleksot na džamijata Hadži

During the year 1641 the complex was renovated and some parts were repaired in 1715; four years later the medrese was repaired again, and yet again after the big fire, which destroyed half of the market in 1864.<sup>39</sup> The inscription on the marble plaque above the main entrance portal indicates the date of renovation: ‘It is renovated in 1293 (1875), 24 Rebiullevvel (19 April).’<sup>40</sup> The whole mosque complex, especially the ‘Türkler medrese’ building, suffered grave damage in the First World War, due to the heavy bombardment in the period between 1916 and 1917.<sup>41</sup> In 1996 the area had an earthquake, which caused the upper parts of the Selcuk style minaret, the most attractive element of this mosque, to collapse. Still, the 18<sup>th</sup> century inn (Han), with a large gate and its inner courtyard with a few longitudinal vaulted buildings, is well preserved. Once a picturesque complex, which comprised a mosque, a medrese with Dar-ül Hadis religious college, a Sibyan mekteb, library, an inn with its commercial warehouses and a drinking fountain, it deserves better treatment than it has today.<sup>42</sup> A work of restoration and conservation would give back to Bitola an important historical monument. The Hacı Bey mosque follows the general outlines of the Selcuk (Bursa) pattern: a square prayer room with a dome set on pendentives and a minaret with polychrome decoration. The interior of the prayer hall measures 11.50 x 11.50 m., with massive walls 1.35 – 1.45 m. thick, built in a combination of two rows of brick and a row of coarse stone.<sup>43</sup> Despite the eight lower windows and six windows above the lower ones, the interior is not very well lit. The mihrab is a simple niche with a stucco stalactite decoration and on the right side is the ruined minbar, decorated with geometrical shapes in stucco; it is still preserved. The hemispherical dome that is supported by pendentives has an octagonal drum ornamented with coarse stone and brick, in diamond honeycomb-shaped decoration. The upper side facades end in a double saw-tooth cornice. The minaret is located on the north-west corner of the prayer room, slightly behind the inner line of the porch. It sits on a polygonal base and has a twelve-sided shaft built of rows of brick and stone. The şerefe balcony has saw-tooth corbels and a balcony with a marble parapet adorned with Koranic

Mahmud Bej vo Bitola’, *Zbornik na trudovi, Zavod za zaštita na spomenicite na kulturata, muzej i galerija Bitola*, vol. 12, 13 (1992-95), 90-91.

<sup>39</sup> Momidić-Petkova, op., cit., 1992-95, 94.

<sup>40</sup> Translated by M. Asimov.

<sup>41</sup> Momidić-Petkova, op. cit., 1992, 95.

<sup>42</sup> Tefvik, op. cit., 214; Ayverdi, op. cit., 107; *Turski dokumenti za istorijata na makedonskiot narod*, op.cit., 1969, Sicil 4, p.28-9/I.

<sup>43</sup> Ayverdi, op. cit., 97; Tomovski, op. cit., 39, 56.



inscriptions.<sup>44</sup> The upper body of the minaret was the most remarkable feature with its 'Zig zag' and hexagonal ceramic-plastic decoration in Selcuk traditional style. Minarets with such an adornment are rarely found in Ottoman architecture on the Balkans. Similar examples can be located on the mosque of Çelebi Sinan Bey in Karaferye of 896 AH/1490-91, the Fatih Cami in Kiustendil of 1462, the Cumaya Cami of Plovdiv built by Murat II (1421-1451), the Alaca Imaret Cami in Selanik of 1486-87; and the Üç Şerefeli Cami in Edirne built in 841-851AH/ 1438-1447. In Anatolia the most famous examples are the Ince Minaret in Konya and Yeşil Cami in Iznik of 1378.<sup>45</sup> According to Machiel Kiel: In certain areas, especially in Central Macedonia, with Monastir-Bitola as the chief center, we see that the old system of decorative brickwork masonry was used for 60 or 80 years longer than in other parts of the Balkans. The mosque of Hacı Mahmud in Bitola, built in 1527, is a very distinctive example... A 'modern' building, as the great mosque of Cadi Ishak Çelebi, built in 1506, was not taken as an example for later works until more than half a century had elapsed.<sup>46</sup> Another fine example of the local traditionalism is the still well preserved inn (Han) building on the west of the mosque. Above the main gate are still visible carved stone figurines and a pair of marble rain sprouts. The one on the right has a carved symbol of a pentagram and an inscription mentioning the year of 1271 AH/ 1854,<sup>47</sup> which might be the year of building renovation. Some parts of the mosque were reconstructed and renovated in 1991. It was supervised by the Institute for the Protection of the Monuments in Bitola. These days the mosque is used as a warehouse surrounded by shops.<sup>48</sup>

### **Koca Ahmed Efendi Cami or Koca Kadı Cami.**

On the right side of the river, in the vicinity of the Upper wood market (Odun Pazar) and the Yeni Hammam, the mosque of Koca Kadı blends into the surroundings of small narrow streets and old houses, but the minaret and brick-decorated façade distinguish the building from its environment. The mosque was erected in the year of Hicra 936 or 1529. It was reg-

istered in the Land Survey register (Tapu Defter) of 1203 AH/ 1799.<sup>49</sup> (Fig. 6. Koca Kadı mosque in 2000) Following his appointment as a judge in the town of Manastır, the Kadı Ahmed Efendi decided to build a mosque and medrese. For the maintenance of the small mosque complex he made a pious endowment. Over the centuries, nothing was left of the vakıf, due to the maladministration of the trustees (mütevelli). The famous medrese that once stood as part of the complex was four times renovated, and according to the Salname statistical data from the beginnings of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, had by then ceased to exist. The mosque had a graveyard (Mezarlık) on the southwest, which comprised a few tombs of local scholars and dervishes: şeyh Efgani Mehmed Efendi, Hacı İbrahim Efendi, Hafız Ali and others.<sup>50</sup> From the whole complex only the mosque is left, and it is in a much-altered state, since for a long period of time it has been used as a dwelling. On the southern side of the complex, on the other side of the street a nice example of a two story Ottoman bey's house with a large courtyard is visible. There might be a historical connection between the house and the mosque, and the nearby Yeni bath, which served the local Muslim community. The modest mosque has a simple rectangular prayer room, 8.80 m. by 8.50 m., covered by a hipped roof. The masonry of the walls is a good Cloisonné work, formed of layers of two horizontally placed bricks, around the cut block of stone. The wall thickness is around 90 cm.<sup>51</sup> On the mihrab side there exist two large marble-framed and iron-grilled windows with three smaller arched windows on the upper side of the wall. At the front on the northwestern side, where the main entrance is located, a simple arched alcove for the latecomers was added. The polygonal stone minaret is attached on the southwestern corner of the prayer hall and its entrance is through the mosque interior. The upper minaret body and its stalactite brick şerefe balcony are partly ruined. The interior of the prayer hall was damaged by the dwellers a long time ago, except for some remnants of the colored mihrab niche in stucco and the flat wooden ceiling (şişe tavan). The main entrance door that was decorated with woodcarvings disappeared a long time ago.<sup>52</sup> There are some similarities with the mosque of Egrikaş Efendi that was once situated in the vicinity. But, the most remarkable similarity can be found in

<sup>44</sup> Momidić-Petkova, op. cit., 1992-95, 91-92; Ayverdi, op. cit., 97.

<sup>45</sup> Goodwin, op. cit., 21, 99-101; Kiel, op. cit., 1990, I/40; Kuran, op. cit., 43, 63, 203; Tomovski, op. cit., 65; Momidić-Petkova, op. cit., 1992-95, 92.

<sup>46</sup> M. Kiel, *Studies on the Ottoman Architecture of the Balkans*, Aldershot, Brookfield 1990, X/3.

<sup>47</sup> Translated by M. Asimov. Again, I am indebted to Dr Asimov for his helpful comments.

<sup>48</sup> Momidić-Petkova, op. cit., 1992, 91.

<sup>49</sup> Tevfik, op. cit., 212; Ayverdi, op. cit., 103.

<sup>50</sup> Tevfik, op. cit., 214, 225, 228.

<sup>51</sup> Ayverdi, op. cit., 103. According to Ayverdi the dimensions of the mosque building were: 8.80m. by 8.90 m. with the wall thickness of 90 cm. Tomovski, op. cit., 57. A porch added later disappeared a long time ago.

<sup>52</sup> Ayverdi, op. cit., 103.

the Iskender Paşa Cami of 1559-1560 in Kanlica on the Bosphorus, designed by Mimar Sinan.<sup>53</sup>

### 5. The Kadı Mahmud Çelebi Cami or Yeni Cami.

The mosque of the Judge Mahmud Efendi, better known as Yeni Cami (the New mosque), occupies an area of 50 m. x 50 m. in the town center, on the right side of the river Dragor. It is ideally situated on the main street and on the square close to the Clock tower and the Church of St Demetrius. The Big Bridge connects it to the Bedestan and the mosque of Ishak Çelebi. (Fig. 7, Yeni mosque and Clock Tower, photo by P. Stavrev)

The local poet La'eli Hasan Efendi sing the praise to the Yeni mosque and it was quoted by Evliya Çelebi in his Seyahatname: It is true this shining mosque Illuminates this city as daylight O La'eli, who has composed a chronogram to this mosque: 'Worship place for the followers of God's emissary.973.'<sup>54</sup> The inscription created by La'eli in the form of a chronogram (Tarih) gives the year of construction 973 AH/ 1565. Other information, giving the year of construction as 966 AH/ 1558-59, has been discussed in the works of M. Tevfik and K. Tomovski.<sup>55</sup> But, according to the calculations of E. Ayverdi and M. Asimov, the chronogram in which the date of construction is given following the verse composed by La'eli, in which every letter has a fixed value (Ebcad hesapı), gives us the exact year 961 AH/ 1553-54.<sup>56</sup> There is another marble plaque at the inner entrance, above the portal, that indicates the mosque was renovated in 1308 AH/ 1890-91, when the portico was rebuilt and extended.<sup>57</sup> The founder of the Yeni mosque or Nal Cami was Mahmud Efendi, a newly appointed judge to the Court in Manastir in 959 AH/ 1551-52.<sup>58</sup>

<sup>53</sup> G.H., Egli, *Sinan, an interpretation*, Istanbul 1997, 88.

<sup>54</sup> Čelebija, op. cit., 57-58; Bursali, op. cit., vol. I, La'eli Hasan Efendi was a poet, translator and writer from Bitola/Manastir in the middle of the 17<sup>th</sup> century.

<sup>55</sup> Tevfik, op. cit., 212; Tomovski, op. cit., 50; Balabanov, Nikolovski, Čornakov, op. cit., 197.

<sup>56</sup> Ayverdi, op. cit. 105; Asimov, op. cit., 2001, 40. According to Asimov, however, this inscription was made for the mosque of Hacı Mahmud Bey.

<sup>57</sup> Tomovski, op. cit., 50. R. Mihajlovski, 'The Yeni mosque in Bitola in the light of the most recent archaeological information', *Patrimonium.MK* 3-4, 5-6, (2008-2009), 183-188.

<sup>58</sup> R. Mihajlovski, 'Byzantine seals unearthed by the archaeological excavations at the Yeni mosque', *Sixth annual Australian Early Medieval association conference, 'Gathering the threads-weaving the early medieval world'*, Monash university, October 2009. The archeologist T. Janakievski, in 2003 started the project 'Ubicatio of Medieval Bitola' and began the archeological excavation in the interior of the Yeni mosque. As a result a

For the maintenance of the mosque and its religious college he organized a pious Vakıf, which included shops, warehouses and houses, with a few hotels and inns, which surrounded the mosque complex.<sup>59</sup> The Judge Mahmud Efendi was also the founder of the medrese. In the small cemetery (mezarlık), near the minaret, the Bektaşî mystic Halil Baba was buried.<sup>60</sup> Around 1589 the local Muslim believers complained to the city administration about the Christians who

medieval wall built out of uncut stone was uncovered in the main prayer hall. Some fragments of fresco painting and ceramic, and human bones were unearthed as well. Chronologically the archaeological material belongs to the period between the 12<sup>th</sup> and 14<sup>th</sup> century. Under the supervision of G. Filipovska-Lazarevska excavations continued between 2004-2008, when the foundation of a 13<sup>th</sup>-14<sup>th</sup> century basilica was uncovered, with central polygonal apse flanked by a deaconicon and a proskomidie on the east section. According to Filipovska-Lazarevska the building was flooded for a long period of time. Foundations of the earliest building were dated in the 7<sup>th</sup> century, then it was rebuilt between the 11<sup>th</sup> and 14<sup>th</sup> century. In the mosque porch some foundations of an early mosque were excavated and they were dated before 1553. Following the archeological excavations in the porch fragments of the basilica complex were unearthed showing some walls extended through the mosque northern wall. Several findings were excavated as well, such as a double sided pectoral medallion (3,5 x 4 cm) from the 11<sup>th</sup> century, probably a creation of the goldsmiths from Constantinople, two silver rings, two 11<sup>th</sup> century lead seals' one with the bust of St. George on obverse and an inscription of ecclesiastical Manglavites of the 11<sup>th</sup> century, and the second one depicting the Holy Virgin Orans and Jesus Christ on the obverse and with an inscription of the Theodore Vestarches of the 11<sup>th</sup> century. The pectoral medallion is decorated with the figures of St. Nicholas and St. Basil, and on the reverse with St. Theodore Tyron and St. Georges. According to Filipovska-Lazarevska the medallion was produced in Constantinople, and has parallels with an 11<sup>th</sup> century medallion from Ohrid. In the Yeni mosque's porch the foundations of an older mosque were unearthed as well. It must be noted that the orientation of the Yeni mosque mihrab is towards the south and the direction of the basilica is eastward and there is a difference between the orientations of the buildings of 90 degrees, the two are at a right angle.

<sup>59</sup> Tevfik, op. cit., 212; Cepenkov, op. cit., 220-223; Hadži Vasiljević, op. cit., 19-20; Cohen, op. cit., 97-113. This mosque had some popular names, such as Nal mosque (The Horseshoe mosque), which is connected to the Christian legend that the mosque was built on the church 'St George' or 'St Demetrius.' The horseshoe was a symbol of the saint's horses. Another popular name was Zincirli bunar cami (A Chained well mosque), connected to the old well, which does not exist any more. Another alternative name was Yeni Cami (the new mosque). A mosque with the same name used to exist in the neighboring town of Hlerin/Florina at the beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> century.

<sup>60</sup> Tevfik, op. cit., 212; Hasluck, op. cit., 360.



Fig. 7, Yeni mosque and Clock Tower, photo by P. Stavrev

owned the houses around the mosque of Mahmud Çelebi. In the judge's record it was stated "the behavior of the Christians affected the Muslims during their prayers".<sup>61</sup> It may be that this place was on the borders of the area where the Christian ward Dabiživ was located. Later the quarter was known as Varoš (suburbia) or Kilise (The church quarter), where the church of St Demetrius was situated. By a Court order the Christians were located elsewhere and from that time the borderline with the Christian quarter 'Kilise' was defined.<sup>62</sup> On October 11, 1829 another Court statement was issued concerning the salaries of the officials employed at the Yeni cami. The new Imam, Hacı Hafız Halil Efendi was going to receive 30 kuruş per month: twenty from the Imam Molla Ismail and the other ten from the trustee (mütevelli) of the vakıf.<sup>63</sup> The mosque was renovated in 1893 by the mason Pavle Ristić from the village of Smilevo, when another three domes with a curtain wall of portico were added.<sup>64</sup> Until 1950 houses and shops surrounded the mosque, but they have been demolished and today the mosque building stands alone in the park, with a

fountain in front. Since that time the monumental Yeni mosque has been carefully preserved and established as a Gallery of Contemporary art and Printmaking. The mosque itself was built on the same prototype plan as the neighboring Ishak Çelebi mosque, but forty-eight years later. The Yeni Cami square prayer room was rather smaller in dimensions, 12.78 m. on each side, with a dome 19 m. high. The masonry of dressed stone used for the walls is more yellowish in colour, than the Ishak Çelebi mosque stone.<sup>65</sup> The dome rests on the octagon and corner squinches and completely envelopes the interior space. The portico has an arcade of granite and marble columns with high stylabates and stalactite capitals. The two rows of three domes of equal size (4 meters in span) cover the bays of the porch (son cemaat yeri), which is 10 X 14.20 meters. The polygonal stone shaft of the minaret's body has a balcony supported by six rows of stalactite decoration, and a point cap covered with sheet lead terminates it. The interior of the prayer room is a spacious, temperate area decorated with sliced and painted stalactite corner squinches. The whole space is illuminated by four rows of windows, of which the lower rows are ornamented with wooden decoration, casement shutters and iron grilles. The Qıble wall has a harmonious mihrab niche adorned with stalactite ornaments (Yaşmak) and a solid minbar decorated with geometrical patterns.<sup>66</sup> There is a very rare construction in the Mahvill mükebbire—a small wooden balcony-overlooking the porch and the prayer hall.

<sup>61</sup> D. Šopova-Bojanić, *Makedonija vo XV i XVI vek, Dokumenti od carigradskite arhivi (1557-1645)*, Skopje 1956, sicil 53.

<sup>62</sup> R. Mihajlovski, 'Bitolskiot soboren hram sveti velikomacenic Dimitrij niz vekovite i negovata obnova vo 1830 godina', *Bitola niz vekovite*, vol. 3, (2007) 43; Idem. 'Prilozi za prucuvanjata na hramot 'Sveti Dimitrij' vo Bitola', *Pelagonitisa* vol. 7-8 (1999) 112 - 124.

<sup>63</sup> *Turski dokumenti za makedonskata istorija, 1827-1839*, vol. 5, (1958) 159, sicil 99/24.

<sup>64</sup> Hadži Vasiljević, op. cit., 19-20.

<sup>65</sup> Tomovski, op. cit., 50; Ayverdi, op. cit., 105.

<sup>66</sup> Idem, 105; Tomovski, op. cit., 42.



Fig. 8, Haydar Kadi mosque, old post card

Access to the mahvill balcony is through the minaret entrance and a short tunnel, which goes horizontally throughout the inner qibla wall, above the entrance. The entrance that communicates between the prayer hall and the porch has wooden panel doorways with carved octagonal rosettes. They contain a Koranic inscription, which comes from the 112th Surrah Al-Ikhlās written with calligraphic Çeli Nesih letters:<sup>67</sup> In the name of God, the most Gracious, the dispenser of Grace Say: ‘He is one God, God the Eternal, the Uncaused cause of All Being He begets not, and neither is He begotten and there is nothing That could be compared with Him.’ Faience decoration of Iznik origin frames the main portal, which has the wooden balcony, carved walnut doors and a glazed ceramic plaque above. The faience plates measure 25 x 25.5 cm. and are decorated in a Cobalt-turquoise color on a white background, as is characteristic of Iznik underglaze tiles of the 16th century and it can be found in the mosque at Komotini in Greece.<sup>68</sup> This is the only ceramic decoration amongst the mosques in Bitola. The interior of the dome, the stalactite squinches, the

<sup>67</sup> Ayverdi, op. cit., 107.

<sup>68</sup> I am very grateful to my colleague M. Ibrahimgil for informative help. See: M. Ibrahimgil, ‘Jeni Dzamiya–Kadı Mahmut Efendi Dzamiya Vo Bitola, (Manastir Yeni Camii-Kadı Mahmut Efendi Camii)’, *Hilal*, Y.4, S.19. Üsküp, 1990, s. 9; Tomovski, op. cit., 42; Andrejević, op. cit., 96; A. Nurhan, A. Raby, *Iznik: the pottery of Ottoman Turkey*, London 1994.

qibla wall surfaces and the mihrab niches were painted in the 16<sup>th</sup> century in the ‘Al secco’ technique. The lowest zone of the walls was decorated with landscapes according to the Koranic traditions of heavenly eschatology with Holy places, all by the Kütahya painting school. Unfortunately an unknown Italian artist repainted these murals, at the beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> century.<sup>69</sup>

**6. The Gazi Haydar Kadi Cami.** The judge Haydar Efendi chose the quarter Kara Oglan as a site for his pious foundation. It was a bit far from the river, in a busy city district opposite the Sheep, the Wood and

the Wheat markets, close to the Deboy Çifte Hamam, the Sungur Çavuş Bey Cami and the largest cemetery (Kabristan) situated on its eastern side.<sup>70</sup> (Fig. 8, Haydar Kadi mosque, old post card)

In accordance with the marble plaque above the main entrance portal, this religious foundation was erected in 969 AH/ 1565. When the War hero (Gazi) Haydar Kadi Efendi was appointed a judge in Bitola, he built an impressive mosque and made a pious endowment, which comprised shops, inns and houses spread between the Pinewood market (Çira Pazarı) and the prison Çengel karakol.<sup>71</sup> To the main vakıf endowments in 1607 were added some other vakıfs of Vizier Ahmed Paşa with an annual fund of 60, 000 akçe and 9, 000 akçe in revenues.<sup>72</sup> Around the year 1610 the Imam of the Haydar mosque was Kurd Halife.<sup>73</sup> When Evliya Çelebi visited it, he expressed his excitement: ‘Gazi Haydar is an artistically splendid edifice for worship.’<sup>74</sup> A religious college was intro-

<sup>69</sup> Andrejević, op. cit., 119-120; Tomovski., op. cit., 50; Momidić, op. cit., 1975, 66.

<sup>70</sup> The mosque of the Haydar kadı had a few popular names, such as Elhan kerde and Rukleva. Çelebija, op. cit., 58; *Turski dokumenti za istorijata na makedonskiot narod* Ser. I, vol.1, (1607-1623), (1963) 2,7; M. Konstantinov, *Bitolskite turci*, Bitola 1961, 37.

<sup>71</sup> Tefvik, op. cit., 212; Tomovski, op. cit., 52.

<sup>72</sup> *Turski dokumenti za istorijata na makedonskiot narod*, op. cit., 1963, 2 sicil 1/ p 16b- P 17b.

<sup>73</sup> Ibidem, op. cit., 1963, 2 sicil 1/1b.

<sup>74</sup> Çelebija, op. cit., 58.



Fig. 9, *The clock tower and a mosque in 1848, painted by E Lear*

duced into the mosque complex and it was renovated five times.<sup>75</sup>

The mosque was an active place of worship until 1912 and was then deserted. During the Battle for Manastir in the First World War the minaret was hit by the artillery and collapsed.<sup>76</sup> After 1945 it was protected as a Monument of culture and restoration with conservation were made between 1960 and 1961, under the supervision of the architect K. Tomovski. The mosque space was intended to be a Lapidarium for Ottoman epigraphic monuments or a Concert hall, but this was never achieved.<sup>77</sup> These days, the monument is abandoned and nobody is taking proper care of it. The medrese vanished a long time ago.

There is a well-preserved inscription on the marble plaque above the main portal. The text in three lines is cut in a rectangular plate of marble, 'Kitabe', measuring 108 x 65 cm. It reads as follows:

*From the most righteous of the Muslim judges  
our gentleman Haydar Kadi.  
Let the Sublime God be pleased to give him a delightful stay  
in Paradise; a Paradise with a spring fountain.  
He built this honorable mosque  
and pleasant place of worship  
only on account of the Sublime Lord  
and looking to be satisfied with (the mosque).  
He was a gracious benefactor  
Year 969.<sup>78</sup>*

<sup>75</sup> Tefik, op. cit., 214.

<sup>76</sup> Andrejević, op. cit., 36; Tomovski, op. cit., 52.

<sup>77</sup> K. Tomovski, 'Konzervacija i restauracija Gazi Hajdar kadijine džamije u Bitolju,' *Zbornik zaštite spomenika kulture*, vol. XIII, Beograd 1962, 51-52; Ayverdi, op. cit., 119.

Gazi Haydar Kadi cami is the most impressive of the Classical Ottoman style mosques in Bitola.<sup>79</sup> It exhibits the harmonious simplicity of proportions, characteristic of the classical tendencies in Ottoman architecture of the 16<sup>th</sup> century. A spacious square prayer hall, 10.95 m. by 10.98 m., is crowned by a 20 m. high dome that sits on a twelve-sided drum and it is connected to the walls by means of corner squinches. The proportions of nearly

1:2 accentuate the height of the dome. The masonry of the walls, between 1.38 and 1.48 m. thick, is composed of two rows of brick alternating with one row of blocks of dressed stone (Kesmetaş).<sup>80</sup> The masonry technique is very similar to that of Sinan's school, which uses this technique of alternating bricks with stone: 'Artfully intermixing with stone or stone banded with bricks—to achieve results he deems appropriate for the contextual occasion.'<sup>81</sup> Similarities can be found at the Sinan Paşa mosque in Yeşiktaş and the Kara Ahmet Paşa külliye at Topkapı in Istanbul from 1550-1560.<sup>82</sup>

The interior space of the Haydar Kadi mosque is richly illuminated by the twelve drum windows and side windows—eight in each wall, except in the wall towards the portico, where there are only four windows. The ribbed and stalactite squinches, placed high on the corners, are expressed as pitched roofed projections, which filled the space between the drum and corners of the building. Such an early example can be seen in Edirne at the Kasim Paşa Cami of 1478<sup>83</sup> and in the Ishakkiye and Yeni mosques in Bitola. Although the interior furniture is badly damaged, the stucco-decorated mihrab with five rows of stalactites is preserved, whereas the mahvill and minbar constructions have nearly disappeared.

<sup>78</sup> Andrejević, op. cit., 36; Asimov, op. cit., 2001, 39.

<sup>79</sup> H. Redžić, *Islamska umjetnost*, Beograd, Zagreb, Mostar 1982, 67-72.

<sup>80</sup> Andrejević, op. cit., 37; Tomovski, op. cit., 1957, 52; Ayverdi, op. cit., 98.

<sup>81</sup> G.H. Egli, *Sinan, an interpretation*, Istanbul 1997, 187.

<sup>82</sup> Idem, op. cit., 70-71.

<sup>83</sup> Kuran, op. cit., 44-45.

On the northern side of the mosque the three-domed portico extends beyond both sides of the prayer hall incorporating the minaret annexes. For the latecomers to prayer, alcoves on the portico substituted for the mihrab inside. An artistically profiled portal with stalactite pendants made of mortar and the marble inscription plaque mark the entry. The finely crafted walnut doors are ornamented with a pair of rosettes, illuminated by a calligraphic text of Surah Ikhlas. An arcade of four columns supports the three-domed portico roof. The two that flank the entry passage feature stalactite capitals and their shafts are made out of green veined marble (Yeşil damarlı).<sup>84</sup> They may have been “spolia” material brought from the nearby ruins of Heraclea Lyncestis Large Basilica or from the quarries in the Debar area.<sup>85</sup> The peripheral columns are made of white marble with lozenge capitals. The bronze collars, used both at the base and its transition from shaft to capital are there to preserve the shafts from earthquake shock waves. Also, Sinan adheres to Ottoman traditions: columns supporting arcades of the mosque featured lozenge capitals, while those supporting porticos have stalactites.<sup>86</sup>

On both sides rise the minaret bases to the portico drum level. The left one is built in a combination of brick and stone, in the same manner as the mosque was built. The right minaret base is built only of

dressed stone. The left one was the only minaret that existed until 1912, but the right one was never completed. Later, this part of the building was used as a ritual washroom. Similarities can be found at the Bali Paşa Cami in Istanbul and Ibrahim Paşa Cami in Silivri Kapı.<sup>87</sup>

According to authors in the field of Ottoman architecture on the Balkans, Tomovski, Redžić, Ayverdi and Andrejević, this mosque is the most harmonious and well-proportioned example of the Classical Ottoman style amongst Bitola’s mosques.<sup>88</sup> For some other scholars this mosque can be ascribed to workmanship, which may have originated from the office of the chief architect Sinan.<sup>89</sup> This hypothetical proposition needs to be clarified, however, because this mosque is not mentioned in the list of Mimar Sinan buildings.<sup>90</sup> It is beyond the scope of this text to do more than point out this problem.<sup>91</sup>

At the end of this study we can conclude that the sixteenth century was the ‘Golden period’ for the development of the medieval Ottoman Seher of Toli Manastir and its religious architecture and art. In spite of natural disasters and armed conflicts, Bitola has still preserved an impressive number of its mosques and material culture generated by the Ottomans in the course of five centuries. (Fig. 9, The clock tower and a mosque in 1848, painted by E Lear).

<sup>87</sup> A. Kuran, *Sinan, the grand old master of Ottoman architecture*, Washington-Istanbul 1987, 101-103; P. Gennaro, *Istanbul, l’opera di Sinan*, Milano 1992.

<sup>88</sup> Tomovski, op. cit., 1957, 52; Ayverdi, op. cit., 98-99; Redžić, op. cit., 72, 75; Andrejević, op. cit., 37, 67.

<sup>89</sup> Balabanov, Nikolovski, Čornakov, op. cit., 195-196; A. Stojanovski, ‘Islamska umetnost vo Makedonija’, *Istorija na makedonskiot narod*, vol I, Skopje 1969, 321.

<sup>90</sup> Kuran, op. cit., 1987, Appendix I, alphabetic list of Sinan Buildings, 254-267, Appendix II, List of Sinan buildings by location, 268-286, Appendix III, Present status of Sinan buildings, 287-297, Appendix IV, Chronological list of extant Sinan buildings with actual or surmised completion dates, 298-301.

<sup>91</sup> This paper was presented at the 13<sup>th</sup> International Congress of Turkish Art, Hungarian National museum, Budapest, September 3-8<sup>th</sup>, 2007.

Contact address: Robert Mihajlovski, La Trobe University, Bundoora 3086, Vic. Australia. Email: r.mihajlovski@latrobe.edu.au

<sup>84</sup> Ayverdi, op. cit., 99; Tomovski, op. cit., 1957, 36, 52.

<sup>85</sup> Tomovski, op. cit., 1957, 34, 36.

<sup>86</sup> Egli, op. cit., 181-184.

## ЦАМИИ ОД ШЕСНАЕСЕТТИОТ ВЕК ВО БИТОЛА/ТОЛИ МАНАСТ'Р

### *Резиме*

При својата посета на шехерот Манаст'р во 1661, Евлија Челеби во својата книга 'Сеџахатнаме' забележал дека градот е на обете страни од реката, поделен е на дваесет и едно маало и има седумдесет и една џамија и месџид, од кои најзначајни биле Исхак Челеби, Махмуд Ефенди, Хаџи Беј, Чавуш џамија, а скоро секоја поголема џамија имала и медреси, кои на број биле девет. (Fig. 1) Шеснаесеттиот век беше златниот период за градот во кој најубавите примери на османлиската архитектура и уметност беа изразени низ религиозните градби. Стилски тие и припаѓаат на Селџучката/Бурса школа, како што се Сунгур Чауш и Хаџи Беј, потоа џамиите од раниот османлиски стил од Едрене и класичниот османлиски стил од Истанбул, од кои се најзабележителни Исхак Челеби, Јени џамија и Хајдар Кади. Најмонументалните османлиски религиозни градби од шеснаесеттиот век се следните сочувани џамии:

**Иса Фак'х или Чинар муфти џами**, на левата страна од реката Драгор на Муфтискиот плоштад во близина на Ески чифте амам и големиот чинар. Изградена е по нарачка на правникот Иса Фак'х, таткото на Исхак Челеби, во 1505-6, а е обновена во 1843. Има правоаголна основа со димензии од 10,25 м x 8,55 м и со покрив на две води, ревак трем на северната страна и минаре. За одржување на џамијата тој востановил еден вакаф што содржел дуќани, куќи и приход од Житниот пазар. (Fig. 2)

**Кади Исхак Челеби џамија или Исхакија**, на левата страна до Големиот мост и Бит пазар. Ја нарача кадијата Исхак откако се премести од Солун во Битола во 1506 година, според хронограмот над влезната врата. За одржување на џамијата,

медресата, библиотеката и имаретот, тој востанови две вакуфнамиња со 300 000 златни дирхеми. Тој беше погребан на гробиштата околу џамијата во 1512. Џамијата му припаѓа на последната фаза на едренскиот ран османлиски стил и прагот на класичниот османлиски стил. Молитвениот простор е 14,52 x 14,52 и висок 26 м. На северната страна беше дограден трем со по два реда куполи под едносливен покрив, по примерот на црковните нартекси наречени 'Лити'. Во 1906 беше посетен од султанот Мехмед Решад петти, за што целата џамија беше обновена. (Fig. 3), (Fig. 4).

**Хаџи Беј** е изградена во 1521/1522, а е реновирана во 1873. Се наоѓа во Рибниот пазар, во старата чаршија на левата страна од реката Драгор. Нарачувачот беше управникот на градот Хаџи Махмуд Беј, познат како Томрук Ага, кој основа вакаф што се состоеше од сума од 300 000 аспри, недвижен имот и приходи од неколку населби. Медресата 'Турклер' и амот беа дел од комплексот, а џамијата беше изградена во Селџучки (Бурса) стил со основа од 11,50 м x 11,50 м и минаре од полихромна декорација, кое делумно настрада во земјотрес во поново време. Ваквата провинциска архитектура е анахронизам со класичниот османлиски стил, кој веќе е присутен во џамијата Исхакија изградена во 1506 г. (Fig. 5)

**Коџа Ахмед Ефенди или Коџа Кади џамија**, изградена во близината на Јени амам и Дрвен пазар во 1529 година од судијата Ахмед ефенди, кој за одржувањето на џамијата и медресата основал вакаф. Скромната џамиска градба е со правоаголен молитвен простор од 8,80 м x 8,50 м и е со покрив на две води, а полигоналното минаре е на југозападната страна и со влез од внатрешноста на џа-

мијата. Околу џамијата постоел еден мезарлик во кој биле погребани неколку локални учени и суфи дервиши. (Fig.6)

**Кади Махмуд Челеби или Јени џамија.** Изградена е од кадијата Махмуд Челеби на десната страна од реката Драгор, во близината на Саат кулата и Безистенот. Според хронограмот на поетот Лаели, кој е прочитан од Ајверди и Асимов, оваа џамија е изградена во 1553-4, а според натписот на влезот, реновирана е во 1890-1 од мајстор Павле од Смилево. Вакафот на џамијата се состоел од дукани, куќи и медреса, а зградата на џамијата имала молитвен простор од 12,71м x 12,71 м и портик од 10 м x 14,20 м. Порталот меѓу нив е украсен со фајансови плочки од Изник од шеснаесеттиот век. Оваа џамија е од истиот тип како Исхак Челебината, но изградена е 48 години подоцна. Помеѓу 2003 и 2009 година се одвиваа археолошките истражувања што резултираа со откривање темели од постара базилика и постара џамија. (Fig. 7)

**Гази Хајдар Кади џамија.** Изградена е во маалото Кара олан, во близина на Овчкиот пазар во

1565 од локалниот судија Хајдар ефенди, што е забележано на натписот над главниот влез. За одржување на задужбината тој оставил еден вакаф составен од куќи, дукани и 60 000 акчиња. Евлија Челеби бил импресиониран од уметничкиот изглед на ова молитвено место. Медресата била дел од овој комплекс, кој бил тешко оштетен за време на Првата светска војна. Внатрешноста на молитвениот простор е 10,95 м x 10,95 м, со купола висока 20 м што дава 1:2 хармоничност на пропорциите. (Fig.8)

Хајдар Кади е најимпресивната џамија на класичниот османлиски стил во Битола и и се припишува на школата на Синан, но оваа хипотеза не е поддржана низ списоците на Синановите градби. (Fig.9)

*Овој напис беше прочитан на Тринаесеттиот конгрес на турска уметност во Унгарскиот национален музеј во Будимпешта, септември 3-8, 2007 година.*

*Му благодарам на мојот колега и пријател, професорот Муџаид Асимов за неговата несебична помош и коментари при пишувањето на овој напис.*